

## ***Rien de plus noble***

### **Une section critique spéciale**

#### **Martin F. Auger**

Dans notre numéro de juillet 2003, nous avons publié une section critique spéciale de *No Higher Purpose*, la première partie de la nouvelle histoire officielle de la Marine royale du Canada. Nous avons alors promis de publier la critique en français dès qu'elle serait disponible. Nous sommes heureux de pouvoir maintenant le faire. Martin Auger est historien au Musée canadien de la guerre.

\*\*\*

W.A.B. Douglas, Roger Sarty et Michael Whitby, avec Robert H. Caldwell, William Johnston et William G.P. Rawling. *Rien de plus noble - Histoire officielle de la Marine royale du Canada pendant la Deuxième Guerre mondiale, 1939-1943, volume 2, partie 1*. St. Catharines, ON : Vanwell Publishing Limited, [www.vanwell.ca](http://www.vanwell.ca), 2003. 744 pp., cartes et figures, photographies, annexes, glossaire, index. CDN 60,00 \$ ; ISBN 1-55125-063-2.

*Rien de plus noble* constitue une importante addition à l'historiographie navale canadienne. Depuis plus de cinquante ans, l'histoire officielle des opérations menées par la Marine royale du Canada au cours de la Deuxième Guerre mondiale n'avait été relatée que dans le livre de Joseph Schull *Lointains Navires* (1950) et les deux volumes de Gilbert Tucker, *The Naval Service of Canada* (1952). La rédaction d'un volume supplémentaire, qui devait incorporer les documents des forces navales alliées et ennemies ainsi que les fichiers classés secrets de leurs services de renseignements respectifs, ne vit jamais le jour en raison d'importantes réductions du budget du ministère de la Défense nationale dans les années qui suivirent les hostilités. De toute évidence, une nouvelle interprétation du rôle que joua la Marine royale du Canada allait devoir être produite dans les années futures. En 1986, le Service historique du ministère de la Défense nationale entreprit de fouiller les archives allemandes, américaines, britanniques et canadiennes, et de scruter les titres publiés depuis les années 1940, afin de rédiger un nouvel ouvrage qui incorporerait les connaissances acquises sur l'évolution de la guerre sur mer. La récolte des documents fut si abondante qu'en 1990 le ministère de la Défense nationale autorisa la production de deux volumes additionnels afin de couvrir les périodes qui précédèrent et suivirent la Deuxième Guerre mondiale. La publication des trois volumes de cette nouvelle histoire officielle de la Marine

royale du Canada devrait être complétée d'ici quelques années. Le présent livre est le premier de cette série à être publié. *Rien de plus noble* est en effet la première partie du volume 2 et analyse les premières années de la Deuxième Guerre mondiale. Le second volume, titré *Une marine de haute mer*, paraîtra sous peu.

Fruit de nombreuses années de recherches approfondies et d'analyses par une équipe d'historiens professionnels de haut calibre, *Rien de plus noble* couvre la période qui s'étend depuis le déclenchement des hostilités en septembre 1939 jusqu'à l'été 1943, lorsque fut créé le Commandement canadien de l'Atlantique du Nord-Ouest, la seule zone d'opération sous commandement canadien pendant la guerre. Le livre comprend deux parties. La première, intitulée « Un rôle à définir », amène le lecteur jusqu'à la fin de 1941. On y cite notamment la planification et la mobilisation de la Marine royale du Canada au début de la guerre ainsi que sa rapide expansion lorsqu'elle participe pleinement aux convois transocéaniques et assume la responsabilité complète de la Force d'escorte de Terre-Neuve en 1941. La seconde partie, « La crise et ses solutions », couvre les événements survenus entre 1942 et 1943. Cette partie met l'accent tant sur les missions côtières que celles de haute mer. Le commencement de l'opération *Paukenschlag*, l'offensive allemande contre la côte est de l'Amérique du Nord lancé au début de 1942, força la Marine royale du Canada à agir unilatéralement et à déployer d'importantes ressources afin d'affronter les sous-marins ennemis qui attaquaient les navires alliés au large du Canada. Le chapitre sur la bataille du Saint-Laurent est particulièrement intéressant, car il démontre comment la Marine royale du Canada géra de façon efficace la campagne contre les sous-marins allemands dans les eaux canadiennes malgré de lourdes pertes. La seconde partie fournit d'importants renseignements opérationnels sur des sujets aussi divers que la progression des convois dans l'Atlantique Nord et les pertes subies du fait de l'ennemi, le déploiement naval canadien dans les Caraïbes, et la participation canadienne à l'Opération Torch, le débarquement allié en Afrique du Nord à l'automne 1942. Les facteurs qui ont mené à la création du Commandement canadien de l'Atlantique du Nord-Ouest sont passés au peigne fin. La seconde partie compte aussi un important chapitre sur les opérations navales menées dans l'océan Pacifique après le déclenchement des hostilités avec le Japon en décembre 1941. Les auteurs étudient notamment le rôle des forces déployées sur la côte ouest, les différentes mesures prises pour repousser une éventuelle invasion japonaise de la Colombie-Britannique, ainsi que des données intéressantes sur des sujets moins connus, tels que la création de la Réserve des pêcheurs, la confiscation des bateaux de pêche de canadiens d'origine japonaise, le bombardement du phare d'Estevan Point sur l'Île de Vancouver par un sous-marin japonais en juin 1942, et les opérations conjointes avec la Marine américaine contre les enclaves japonaises dans les Îles aléoutiennes au large de l'Alaska entre 1942 et 1943.

Rien de plus noble place la participation de la Marine royale du Canada à la Bataille de l'Atlantique et aux autres opérations navales alliées qui eurent lieu dans le monde durant les premières années de la guerre dans sa vraie perspective historique. Les auteurs expliquent de façon convaincante que malgré de nombreuses difficultés, la Marine royale du Canada fit le maximum pour protéger les convois et contrer la menace sous-marine

ennemie, et ce, avec les ressources humaines et matérielles limitées dont elle disposait à l'époque. Le livre nous fait mieux comprendre le rôle crucial qu'elle joua au sein d'une alliance dominée par les marines américaines et britanniques. *Rien de plus noble* est une œuvre monumentale qui incorpore de nombreuses années de recherche et d'analyse. On y retrouve de plusieurs photographies inédites ainsi que des cartes précises illustrant la progression des convois et les batailles navales. Cet imposant livre de plus de 700 pages comporte aussi une importante annexe fournissant des données pertinentes sur les pertes en hommes de la Marine royale du Canada durant la guerre, sur les douze navires de guerre canadiens perdus entre septembre 1939 et avril 1943, et sur les seize sous-marins allemands et italiens détruits par les forces canadiennes au cours de la période. *Rien de plus noble* sera de toute évidence un outil indispensable à tout chercheur s'intéressant à l'évolution de la Deuxième Guerre mondiale sur mer et à la participation du Canada au conflit.

Martin F. Auger  
Ottawa, Ontario

**CANADIAN NAUTICAL RESEARCH SOCIETY**

**NOMINATIONS FOR 2005 ELECTION OF COUNCIL**

The following positions need to be filled by election at our annual general meeting in Hamilton on Saturday, 18 June 2005.

President	Secretary
1 <sup>st</sup> Vice President	Treasurer
2 <sup>nd</sup> Vice President	Membership Secretary

and four members of council

Any two members in good standing may nominate any other member in good standing for any of these positions. Nominations, or suggestions for nomination, should be sent to

William Glover  
CNRS Nominating Committee  
163 Churchill Crescent  
Kingston, Ontario, K7L 4N3.

Or by fax to: (613) 546-8428

or by e-mail to: [williamglover@sympatico.ca](mailto:williamglover@sympatico.ca)

## BOOK REVIEWS

Lydia T. Black. *Russians in Alaska, 1732-1867*. Fairbanks, AK: University of Alaska Press, [www.uaf.edu](http://www.uaf.edu), 2004. xv + 328 pp., colour plates, maps, photographs, illustrations, bibliography, index. US \$29.95, paper: ISBN 1-889963-0504.

*Russians in Alaska, 1732-1867* is a book that will become a standard reference on the history of the Russian presence in northwestern North America. For many years Lydia Black's contributions to our knowledge of Russian America have been extraordinary. This work, however, stands apart. It is perhaps the most comprehensive treatment of the topic, the breadth and depth of research are inspiring; and the analysis of information is balanced and judicious.

The task Dr. Black outlines is to integrate Russian language archival materials more fully into a new synthesis of the history of Russia in America. To that end she re-evaluates the role of "great men" and offers a wealth of information that undercuts a number of popular notions about Russia in America. This is crucially important because so much of what has been published about the Russian experience in America — from the very first Russian accounts of expansion across the Pacific and continuing into the era of the popular American histories of the last century — has been written with ends and purposes that often had less to do with Russia America than with other objectives. Dr. Black's new synthesis acknowledges the contributions of ordinary people who lived and worked and died in Russian American and recognizes how they dealt with the circumstances of their life.

The fur trade provided the impetus for Russian expansion across northern Asia and into North America. Dr. Black recounts that expansion but also adds new information about the men from the north in European Russia who actually trekked and trapped across Siberia and then made their way across the islands of the northern Pacific. These men encountered and ultimately lived and worked with the indigenous peoples of Siberia and then the Aleutians and the northwest American coast. *Russians in America* presents a far more complete picture of that relationship.

Russian voyages of exploration and discovery played a crucial role in the story of Russian America and form a compelling and illustrative part of Dr. Black's narrative. Settlement of territory in North America —

colonization — was never an objective of Russia's eastward advance across the northern Pacific and she explains the far-reaching consequences for Russian America.

As time passed, large companies replaced the original small Russian entrepreneurs. Of particular interest are Dr. Black's insights into the internal dynamics of these companies and the political machinations that eventually tipped the balance in favour of the Shelikhov-Golikov Company. Grigorii Shelikhov emerges as a man with motives and objectives far more complicated and questionable than past studies would suggest. Also of interest is his wife, Natalia, whose role in the formation of the Russian-American Company and its policies beg further study.

Though the degree of official Russian government interest in the Pacific and then in North America waxed and waned, it was always a consideration. Beyond the government's strategic and scientific interests, the fur trade was a source of revenue important enough to regulate, especially with China. The government also formulated policies to protect indigenous people both in Siberia and Alaska and to support missionary work by church groups. New information elucidates each of these elements.

*Russians in America* includes a comprehensive look at the decades of Alexander Baranov's tenure as manager in Russian America. Dr. Black has carefully evaluated the man and the nature of his authority, his contributions and his shortcomings. She has also examined another controversial figure in the history of Russian America - Alexander Rezanov, whose talent for self-promotion has obscured factual information about the negative consequences of his role in the affairs of the region.

The fate of post-Baranov Russian America was inextricably linked with changing international and economic realities and a new form of governance in the territory, with naval officers managing on behalf of the Russian-American Company and the government. Dr. Black adds to our knowledge of this period and the factors that ultimately led to the sale of Alaska to the United States.

Dr. Black has also examined the role of the Church in Russian America. In particular, she has reevaluated the first spiritual mission to Russian America and the careers of the clerics who arrived in Alaska. Her work casts a far more favourable light on these individuals. She

looks at the presence of the Church in the years afterward and highlights the careers of Ioann Veniaminov, whose work has been well studied, and Iakov Netsvetov, whose contributions are less well known. It is her conclusion that Russian Orthodoxy was the unique and lasting link between the Russians in America and the indigenous peoples of the territory that was Russian America.

*Russians in America, 1732-1867* is impressive, interesting and highly readable. This work reflects Lydia Black's vast knowledge, careful scholarship and fine writing. Those of us interested in Russian America are in her debt.

Judith Ball Bruce  
Sandston, Virginia

Stephen R. Bown. *Scurvy: How a Surgeon, a Mariner and a Gentleman Solved the Greatest Medical Mystery of the Age of Sail*. Toronto: Thomas Allen Publishers, [www.t-allen.com](http://www.t-allen.com), 2003. 254 pp., illustrations, maps, appendix, timeline, notes, bibliography, index. CDN \$34.95, cloth; ISBN 0-88762-130-9.

In this volume Bown gives an overview of the history of scurvy and the British navy in the eighteenth century, focusing on the contributions of James Lind (naval surgeon, later physician), James Cook (explorer), and Gilbert Blane (aristocratic physician). These three men, as well as others, attempted to understand the nature of scurvy in order to battle this disease, the greatest naval killer. Longer journeys as well as larger ships and naval forces resulted in significant loss of life and concomitant operational inefficiencies. Bown reviews the period from Lord Anson's scurvy plagued voyage in the 1740s to the virtual elimination of the disease after 1795 when the Navy made the use of lemon juice obligatory.

Bown is right to acknowledge that he has written a "popular rather than scholarly book" [231]. There are no footnotes, and both the notes on sources and the bibliography are very selective. Nor are the sources for most of the illustrations acknowledged. Bown has relied on the work of others and stitched together a readable, sometimes quite enjoyable, account that does not, however, enhance our understanding of the topic.

Indeed, Bown takes us backwards in his anachronistic reading of eighteenth century medical thought and practice. Again and again he condemns, with the benefit of hindsight, the "preposterous", "wildly off-base" "stubborn"

"useless", "blinded", "harebrained", "gaseous" and "peculiar" (humoural) theories of medical contemporaries that ran "against all common sense" and were "rubbish" [6, 8, 36, 37, 46, 73, 77, 84, 85, 103, 104, 124]. Historians of medicine over the last generation have sought to understand medicine within the context of its own time, rather than writing heroic and teleological histories.

There are significant absences in his bibliography, none perhaps more so than the piece by Christopher Lawrence entitled 'Disciplining Disease: Scurvy, the Navy, and Imperial Expansion, 1750-1825' (in D.P. Miller and P.H. Reill, eds., *Visions of Empire: Voyages, Botany, and Representations of Nature*, Cambridge University Press, 1996, 80-106). In that essay, without at all debunking the importance of James Lind, the author shows the importance of recovering the historical meanings of terms easily misunderstood through conflation with today's usages, and of reconstructing earlier notions of medical institutions. Lawrence highlights the significance of earlier developments in British naval medicine, including the gradual evolution of ideas and practices, such as the medical discipline of anonymous populations onboard ship, the rise of preventative medicine, routine observation, as well as regularized examination and punishment. Naval medicine influenced, and was influenced by, these changes (in forums like the Royal Society), and was affected by wider social processes.

Bown's focus on three individuals at times oversimplifies the story. He almost completely ignores Thomas Trotter, for example (indeed there is no mention of Trotter's "Observations on the Scurvy"). There is a significant amount of sometimes far-fetched speculation about people's thoughts and motives. This is especially the case where it concerns villains of the piece, such as John Pringle, the physician who criticized Lind's promotion of citrus rob (a form of concentrate). Bown states, for example, that as a result of Pringle's "stubborn" streak he stood by and watched a friend die of scurvy rather than advise him to consume vegetables or fruit juices. There are also a number of unnecessary discussions about what might have happened if such and such had, or had not, occurred (America might not have won its battle for independence when it did if the cure for scurvy had been found earlier for example). There are some errors of fact, such as when Bown implies that the Admiralty sought to clear out Chelsea Hospital's invalids for Anson's voyage in order to make way for those freshly wounded at sea (Chelsea was a hospital for army veterans and

the Admiralty had no authority to place naval personnel in it).

Although Bown condemns humoral medicine's ideas about scurvy he does, with some care, explain these ideas to the reader and (albeit all too briefly) mentions the wider significance of the preventative, social, medicine of Blane. There are few copyediting errors and the index is useful.

It is a great story, which has been told several times. Bown tells it again with some effect in a popular form. It would have been better though had Bown been less the fellow combatant with Lind, Cook and Blane against their contemporary enemies, and more detached and familiar with recent approaches to the history of medicine.

Geoffrey L. Hudson  
Thunder Bay, Ontario

Stephen E. Bruneau. *Icebergs of Newfoundland and Labrador. A Field Guide*. St. John's, NL: Flanker Press, [www.flankerpress.com](http://www.flankerpress.com), 2004. 65 pp., maps, photographs, illustrations. CDN \$ 14.95, paper; ISBN 1-894463-68-4.

This booklet first appeared some six years ago as a black and white publication. Its intention was to provide tour boat operators with correct interpretive information for tourists. Others, such as the offshore industry, broadened the interest in the book let that led to this fifth edition and the first in colour. The attractiveness of this booklet is in the sequential presentation of the information together with the clear and colourful design and layout. There are five sections in all, the first four in text and the fifth in graphics.

Section 1 covers the nature of icebergs to be seen off the coasts of Newfoundland and Labrador. Frequently asked questions concerning bergs open the explication. The origin, age, number, form, size, flotation, colour, movements, temperature, decay, specific gravity and iceberg operations are briefly discussed.

The second section is given over to facts suitable for a trivia game, e.g. "the hydrologic cycle is the process whereby water ... becomes incorporated into living things including us ... it is possible that a part of you ... was once an iceberg." [13]

Historical (popular) in nature, Section 3 provides excerpts from reports by, among others, such Polar luminaries as St. Brendan, George Weymouth, Edmund Halley, James Cook, William Scorsby, and James Clarke Ross. The section concludes with two pieces of modern poetry, one of which is by the author. Removal of this section from the guide would

not detract from the given methods of iceberg observing.

Section 4, consisting of two pages on berg watching, completes the textual part of the booklet with suggestions on whom to contact, what to wear, where to go, and when.

Section 5 is the *piece de resistance* of *Icebergs of Newfoundland and Labrador*. Here, all the matters discussed in the previous sections are displayed in a self-evident manner that, together with the first section, would, I think, achieve the author's purpose. One hundred and twenty-three sketches, photos and visual aids illustrate the techniques of observing icebergs off Newfoundland and Labrador. Of particular note is the included form that provides for the recording by the observer of iceberg location, weather, size, shape, movement and features.

A field guide, to be physically serviceable, needs to be of a handy size and of durable material. *ICEBERGS of Newfoundland and Labrador* meets these criteria, measuring 21.5 cm x 14.5 cm., with plasticized covers and a plastic coil binding.

An ideal reference for non-scientific observers, this booklet would be popular on Arctic cruise ships, amateur expedition vessels and with the sea- kayaking fraternity. A copy in both public and school libraries would benefit the public at large. For those wishing a more rigorous approach to the topic, the author lists three learned sources.

Len Forrest  
Ottawa, Ontario

Bernard Edwards. *The Quiet Heroes. British Merchant Seamen At War*, Barnsley: Leo Cooper, [www.pen-and-sword.co.uk](http://www.pen-and-sword.co.uk), 2004. 182 pp., photographs. £19.95, cloth; ISBN 0-85052-911-5.

*The Quiet Heroes* is a series of vivid sketches describing twenty-three incidents involving British merchant ships between 1939 and 1943. Two of these vessels fought off their attackers but the rest were sunk. The book is adventure non-fiction, i.e. the accent is on action with little analysis of common threads behind the sinkings, the backgrounds of the merchant seamen involved or the vicissitudes they experienced stoically. Bernard Edwards, a retired master mariner, has produced several similar books about maritime mishaps. He is a riveting story teller whose taut language deftly conveys the essential details of each incident. The manner in which Edwards draws on his practical nautical

background to sketch in passage information, weather conditions, types of cargo carried and the particulars of individual ships is particularly skilful. The author is adept at creating immediacy by weaving each story around the experiences of one or two individuals.

The incidents he includes involved encounters with submarines, surface raiders and aircraft in the Atlantic and Indian Oceans. The diverse voyages and cargoes described are reminders of the complexity of wartime trade carried by Allied shipping. While some of the ships cited were in convoy, most were sailing independently. Several incidents ended in harrowing voyages in lifeboats and liferafts. The story of Seaman Gunner Horace Bailey, the sole survivor of the fifty-three man crew of the freighter *Fort Mumford*, sunk in the Indian Ocean by a Japanese submarine in March 1943, is particularly astonishing. After drifting without food on wreckage for five days, Bailey was picked up by a dhow on passage from the Malabar Coast of India to Tanganyika. He spent forty-three days with his rescuers before being landed in good health.

While survival in small boats figures in several of Edwards' stories, he does not tackle this subject systematically. Apparently more than 4,300 seafarers made open-boat voyages during the war. It would have been interesting to learn how emergency rations and survival equipment evolved. For example, the reader learns [149] that the *Cornish City*, torpedoed by a U-boat east of Madagascar in July 1943, was equipped with a new type of wooden DAB-type life-raft with a shaped bow and stern and drop keel. Six of the ship's crew of forty-six survived on two DAB rafts for over twenty-four hours before fortuitously being sighted by an aircraft. One wonders how DAB-type rafts were first devised when and how widely they were fitted. The book concludes with an overview of merchant seamen casualties during the war and an elegy for the British mercantile fleet which has largely vanished since 1975. The specific sources for the stories are not given but the Imperial War Museum, the National Maritime Museum in Greenwich and the Public Records Office at the National Archives are cited. The brief bibliography lists only two books published after 1989.

Edwards is meticulous about tracing the later careers of German and Japanese submarine and surface raider captains. It is striking that by contrast he never includes the subsequent experiences of the British merchant seamen whose stories are narrated. While the descriptions of individual incidents are models

of gripping narrative, there are problems in the coverage of the wider struggle at sea. There are numerous errors of fact and tendentious assertions such as that sailing independently was safer than in convoy. In fact, the loss rate of unescorted ships over the entire war was at least twice that of ships under escort. The descriptions of U-boat and escort tactics are inaccurate. A handful of books by authors with seafaring backgrounds about how ordinary British merchant seamen experienced extraordinary events in wartime have been published over the past two decades. *The Quiet Heroes* stands out because of the author's skill as a story teller and use of his seaman's eye to produce satisfying vignettes about heroism in horrific circumstances.

Jan Drent  
Victoria, British Columbia

Ladislav Farago. *Burn after Reading. The Espionage History of World War II*. Annapolis: Naval Institute Press, [www.NavalInstitute.org](http://www.NavalInstitute.org). Blue Jacket Books, 2003. xiv + 319 pp., bibliography, index. US \$ 18.95, cloth; ISBN 1 591142628. (Originally published 1961)

Espionage is a topic that fascinates millions. Whether it is the mass consumption, "shaken not stirred" variety of James Bond or accounts of true exploits, we are fascinated by tales of daring spy action and courage. In light of 9/11, this interest has dramatically increased. It is in this environment that Ladislav Farago's *Burn after Reading* has been re-released. Originally published in 1961, at the height of the Cold War, Farago's book examines the story of espionage during the Second World War. It is not a definitive account by any stretch of the imagination. The author himself admits that the topic area is far too vast to allow such an account in a single volume. Rather, it samples a wide variety of "espionage" activities.

The account that Farago provides is a fascinating one, in part because it focuses on topics which are not commonly covered in general accounts of the war. The topics are quite wide ranging. All three theatres of war are examined although the majority of the discussion rests with the war in Europe. Topics range from the state of pre-war intelligence among the belligerent powers (including attempts to set up spy rings), the use of espionage to pave the way for ground operations (the incident in Poland that started the war, operation Barbarossa, D-Day, etc), Japanese

espionage leading up to the Pearl Harbor, American code-breaking, and the capture of Richard Sorge - the Soviet Union's most infamous spy - by the Japanese. Despite the enormous amount of material covered, Farago's easy but lively writing style makes reading his work a very enjoyable experience.

I would highly recommend this work for the general reader who is interested in the Second World War or intelligence issue. An enjoyable read, it will whet the appetite and hopefully encourage the reader to examine the events more closely. For the scholarly audience, however, *Burn after Reading* is rather deficient at several levels. The most obvious weakness rests with Farago's incredibly broad definition of espionage, including not just clandestine operations and sabotage but intelligence gathering, counter espionage, subversion and any activity that does not include formal or conventional combat operations. His inclusion of very divergent activities, intelligence gathering versus sabotage, for example, or subversion versus counter espionage, makes it very difficult to assess this work. By covering so many different topics without defining them, the author dilutes his effort — making it a very general account of activities — and makes it all but impossible to assess which of the operations were most important or had the greatest impact on the war. When combined with his conscious choice to avoid analysis, the result is a general group of stories regarding a variety of activities that are not conventional warfare. The irony of this is that the author went out of his way in his preface to describe the massive scale of the clandestine war conducted from 1939 -1945 involving vast resources and huge amounts of manpower. If the topic was of such scale and importance, surely a more detailed scholarly approach would yield a far better account.

Two other problems stand out — the absence of new material and the lack of citations in the text. It is clear that this book has not received many changes from its original 1961 form. None of the material listed in the bibliography comes from the post-1961 period. In the forty-plus years since its initial release, there has been a wealth of scholarship in the area and the declassification of documents relating to "espionage." The release of ULTRA materials relating to the war in the Atlantic stands out as an excellent example of this. Unfortunately, the failure to include such information is a very great disappointment and a lost opportunity. The lack of footnotes is a similarly important flaw. Farago maintains that a great deal of information came from personal accounts and interviews.

Yet not a single citation exists to indicate from whom the information came or where and when it was obtained. In 1961 this approach was more acceptable. In the current scholarly environment, however, citations are expected if not required and some references in the bibliography to these sources is the norm. Overall, I would rate this as a good book for the general reader or someone interested in the area on a personal basis. While entertaining, it remains a collection of stories that constitutes popular literature. For scholars or students looking for a definitive account of espionage during the Second World War, this book falls short as an effective historical work.

Robert M. Dienesch  
Tecumseh, Ontario

Ian Friel. *The British Museum Maritime History of Britain and Ireland c. 400-2001*. London: The British Museum Press, distributed by the David Brown Book Company, Oakville, CT., [www.oxbowbooks.com](http://www.oxbowbooks.com). 2003. 304 pp., illustrations, notes, bibliography, index. £25.00, cloth; ISBN 0-7141-2718-3.

Maritime history is defined by the author as "the history of human activities relating to the sea and seafaring." The importance of this definition lies in alerting the reader to what will be included in such a broad survey of the maritime experience of Britain and Ireland. Naval history, merchant shipping, shipbuilding, fishing and a range of other activities are incorporated in this carefully constructed volume. Although sixteen centuries are surveyed in only seven chapters, there are general observations of value to both the general reader and specialist.

"A boat to the island of ghosts, c. 400-700," is the opening chapter. The Byzantine historian Procopius envisioned Britain as a terminal point for souls rowed there from the continent. But subsequent recovery followed the Roman retreat from Britain, when the conquering Saxons began a new maritime era. Friel shares the view of many that it is unlikely that the use of sail died out in northern Europe between the fifth and seventh centuries despite the lack of archaeological evidence. The discussion of shipbuilding and technical change continues throughout the book.

The second and third chapters cover the periods from c. 700 to 1066 and 1066 to c. 1500. The presentation of the Anglo-Saxon maritime experience is expansive, beginning with the trade from Kent to France and

Germany. The use of the German word-element *wic*, meaning "trading place" is noted in town names, including Londenwic (London), Aldwyche, Ipswich and Schleswig. Trade with attendant conquest is discussed in a review of the appearance of the Vikings. As he does throughout the volume, Friel includes Ireland and all of Britain in his discussion by tracing events in Scotland and Wales.

General works covering broad periods sometimes fail to make declarative statements or work to conclusions. Friel is to be commended for making assessments. About Anglo-Saxon England he states "...but naval forces whether they belonged to the king or to Earl Godwine - played an important role in pre-Conquest English politics. Like the army in some twentieth-century Third-World nations, the fleet was a political as well as a military weapon, and the opinions of ordinary sailors mattered to those in power in a way that they would not do again for many centuries [48]." Those readers who value the significance of the wine trade will be gratified to read that the use of the 252-gallon wine tun to measure a ship's capacity "...underlies the importance of the wine trade for English shipping; no one ever seems to have thought of rating a ship on the basis of how many woolsacks or broadcloths it could carry [64]." The personal element is incorporated by example, such as the Hawley family of Dartmouth in the fifteenth century to illustrate how pirates and privateers were often the same.

The origins of the Royal Navy are traced to the Tudor era which coincides with the age of oceanic exploration and travel. These topics are the focus of chapter four, "Into the Ocean, c. 1500-1600" and reflect Friel's previous work at the Mary Rose Trust. The *Mary Rose* is Henry VIII's great ship that was lost in 1545, discovered in the 1970s, and is now a premier exhibit at Portsmouth. Among the many insights gained from studies of the *Mary Rose* is the understanding that the huge superstructures of the carrack were giving way to lower ones that reduced wind resistance and improved manoeuvrability.

"Fall and rise, c. 1600-1815" focuses on a navy in decline from the reign of James I, and one challenged by the Netherlands. A strengthened English navy engaged in the line-of-battle conflicts that marked a new era in naval warfare. The benefits of victory in many of the wars were gained in the colonies rather than in Europe. Lord Nelson receives expected credit as the outstanding naval commander of all time. The changed nature of warfare at sea, in which he excelled, resulted in the destruction of ships

rather than their capture, but the men paid the price: 1,679 British casualties at the Battle of Trafalgar, and perhaps 8,000 French and Spanish casualties.

Conflict at sea in multi-decked purpose-built warships coincided with developments in merchant vessels that included ships engaged in the traffic in humans. "Britain became the most successful slave-trading nation in the world, and it is reckoned that between 1662 and 1807, when the trade was abolished, just over 3.4 million slaves were carried from West Africa to the Americas in ships belonging to Britain and her colonies. This was as many as all of the other European slave-trading nations put together [162]." Friel's analysis of slavery from a maritime perspective cuts to the core of the issue of Britain's involvement.

The chapter covering the transition from sail to steam, "Pax Britannica, 1815-1914" characterizes the era as an age of "gunboat diplomacy." The last major actions of sailing ships were fought against Algerine pirates and later, in 1827 at Navarino Bay against the Turks. The transition to steam and iron was successfully managed by Britain's Royal Navy, the leading naval force in the world in 1815 and in 1914. The navy grew to match the challenges of old enemy France, and a rising Germany. Britain commanded one-third of the world's warship construction market until WWI. Her merchant marine was the world's largest, amounting to 34 percent of all ocean-going tonnage. But growth and technological changes affected the life and work of mariners.

Conditions improved in some ways and worsened in others. The temptation to use cheap or convenient labour led some to abusive behaviour. A Welsh shipowner who was also a Poor Law Guardian was said to use the local ragged schools to supply cheap labour for his ships. One captain reflected "I sometimes wonder if God will hold such men guiltless that lived on men and boys' labour at the expense of their body and soul [232]."

The First and Second World Wars dominate the final chapter, "Flogging out, 1914-2001." German U-boats did tremendous damage in both wars. The intelligence work in the Second World War that cracked the Enigma code helped save a disastrous situation. Victory over Germany led to the creation of a British Pacific Fleet to press the war against Japan. At the end of the war, Britain was broke and lacked the resources and will to rebuild her fleet. Within two decades the empire built on seapower was gone.

The transfer of sovereignty to former colonies led to further reductions in the Royal Navy. The controversial Falklands War with Argentina in 1982 was a British victory, but at a high price. It pointed out the effectiveness in sea warfare of submarines and low-flying missiles. But the victory did not lead to investment in a stronger navy. The end of the Cold War meant reductions in the military. Women filled some of the gaps in naval personnel; the first female Royal Navy sailor went to sea in 1991. As of 2002 women were excluded from frontline combat although twenty percent of officer candidates were female.

British merchant shipbuilders had 61 percent of the market in 1913. In 1997 that number was 0.7 percent. Shipyards and the labour pool shrank accordingly. Opportunities in the fishing fleets shrank as the "cod wars" with Iceland ended in 1978 with British trawlers excluded from a 200-mile territorial zone.

So, is Britain and Ireland's maritime history over? Has human technological innovation overcome the restrictions of geography? After all, since 1994 one can travel between Britain and France by the Channel Tunnel. Ian Friel has written an informed and provocative history that can be enjoyed by the specialist and the general reader. I highly recommend it.

Timothy J. Runyan  
Greenville, North Carolina

William Glover, ed. *Charting Northern Waters. Essays for the Centenary of the Canadian Hydrographie Service*. Montreal: McGill-Queen's University Press, [www.mqup.ca](http://www.mqup.ca), 2004. 276 pp., maps, illustrations, photographs, tables, notes, bibliography, index. CDN \$ 60, cloth; ISBN 0-773527109.

Editor William Glover has done an excellent job in bringing together ten essays by an international group of authors. There is something of interest for hydrographers, historians and all Canadians interested in the evolution of the knowledge of our coasts.

This book is not a *Chartmakers* (NC Press Ltd., Toronto, 1983), which was produced as a semi-public relations coffee table book for the centenary of the Georgian Bay Survey, the direct antecedent of the Canadian Hydrographie Services (CHS). *Charting Northern Waters* has greater depth and is written for a more knowledgeable audience. The book is well structured, taking the reader through the hydrographie surveys of Canada in a logical

step-by-step sequence. The authors fully cover the methods used throughout the surveys of the period, the instruments available, their accuracies and deficiencies. In addition, we are given the roots of the small organizations within Canada and Russia and how, over time, they combined and evolved into the umbrella of today's national hydrographie services.

The selection of topics is interesting. As expected, we have the beginnings in New France, but in a bold decision we do not follow with the surveys of Captain James Cook, who charted on two of our three coasts. Glover rightly states that Cook's work is widely known and has been recounted *ad nauseam*. Instead, an essay on Alejandro Malespina who explored the west coast for the Spanish authorities is included. Canadians east of British Columbia generally have little knowledge of the late eighteenth- and early nineteenth-century Spanish expeditions along the BC coast.

The charting of Canada's coasts began in the period of colonial expansion by the French on the east coast and by the Spanish and the British in the Pacific. When the primary exploratory charts were published by the different European governments, there were varying degrees of international cooperation. In general, the seventeenth-century charts were of little reliable use to the navigator, but in the next century, the British and French Hydrographie Offices began the formal gathering of the piecemeal collection of data into cohesive publications.

In France, the Royal Academy of Sciences, which held a monopoly on publication, regarded hydrography from a mainly scientific point of view. Their grip was broken by La Galissonière, who during his term as director of the navy's hydrographie office, returned the emphasis to the practical aspect of hydrography and provided French naval officers with the most advanced charting in the world at that time.

British Columbia is taken as an example of the naval and political surveys of the Royal Navy. With the threat of American interests in the Pacific, the coastal charts were made and published in the interest of commerce as well as to provide political ammunition in the definition of boundary disputes.

It is invidious to select specific essays from such a well-matched set, but from an informative point of view, I applaud the inclusion of an essay on Russian hydrographie work in the Northern Oceans. For most readers, the survey of the Russian littoral from Murmansk to Dezhneva Cape is unknown and this contribution is valuable.

History must also have its personal side and Admiral Ritchie's accounts of surveys in the last work of the British Admiralty in Canadian waters in Labrador casts a light on the arduous work of the Royal Navy hydrographers under great hardships. Much of this has already been written in his book *HMS Challenger - the Life of a Survey Ship* (Hollis and Carter Ltd., London, 1957) but I doubt if this book attracted a large readership on this side of the Atlantic. This will be remedied by his enthralling essay.

*Charting Northern Waters* is well referenced and indexed and the illustrations add greatly to the essays.

Hydrography in Canada has always been spurred by political policies and nautical disasters. As the present Dominion Hydrographer notes in his foreword, Canada still has large areas of its coasts that are unsurveyed or inadequately so. We do not presently appear to have the foresight or financing to further the work of our forefathers. The loss of the *Asia* (1882) in Georgian Bay; the grounding of the *Parthia* (1890) in Burrard Inlet and the grounding of the *Sicilian* (1903) in the St. Lawrence river all spurred hydrographic activity on our coasts. Which ship will be next? Environmental clean-up costs greatly outweigh the expense of an adequately funded Canadian Hydrographic Service.

R. W. "Sandy" Sandilands  
Victoria, British Columbia

Julian Gwyn. *An Admiral for America: Sir Peter Warren, Vice Admiral of the Red, 1703-1752*. Gainesville: University Press of Florida, [www.upf.com](http://www.upf.com), 2004. xv + 228 pp., illustrations, maps, notes, glossary, bibliography, index. US \$59.95, cloth; ISBN 0-8130-2709-8.

Julian Gwyn first began work on this book in the 1960s, but was diverted into the preparation of *The Royal Navy and North America: the Warren Papers, 1736-1752* for the Navy Records Society (Vol. 118, 1973, though Gwyn maintains that it appeared in 1975). Then came Gwyn's analysis of Warren's private fortune, *The Enterprising Admiral. The Personal Fortune of Admiral Sir Peter Warren* (McGill-Queen's University Press, 1974). Nearly forty years would pass before he returned to his original goal of writing a naval biography of the admiral, yet to judge by the small number of recent secondary works found in the somewhat thin bibliography - Rodger's *The Wooden World* is only the most conspicuous example that comes

quickly to mind - Gwyn does not appear to have taken advantage of the intervening years to add significantly to his original research. The result is a rather traditional biography, one that does not offer the kind of innovative interpretation promised by including it in a series dedicated to "New Perspectives in Maritime History and Nautical Archaeology."

Not that Gwyn does not provide useful insights into the life and career of an eighteenth-century sea officer. In the first chapter on Warren's early life, we learn that, though his parents were Roman Catholic, Warren converted to the Church of England, thereby following the example of his uncle, Lord Richard Aylmer, and ensuring a smoother path through the ranks of the Royal Navy. In Chapter 2 we discover how Warren's service in colonial American waters opened the door to marriage into a prestigious colonial family, as well as the first of many acquisitions of land by which his later fortune would be made secure. The chapter also describes Warren's first experience with combined operations in the ill-fated expedition in 1740 against St. Augustine, the principal Spanish settlement on the Atlantic coast of North America. Warren's fortune and career are made in Chapters 3 and 4, during his war service in Europe, the West Indies and North America. Success at capturing prizes guaranteed the former, while his experience first in the combined operation at Cartagena in 1741 where he served under Admiral Vernon, and later at Louisbourg where he was the commanding naval officer, ensured the latter. Yet it is also apparent that Warren's success rested just as much on good luck, responsive patrons, and knowing how best to beg and plead for choice appointments - witness his success at staying in the Mediterranean [45] and then securing a Caribbean command [46-7].

Luck and skill also play their part in Chapter 5 during Warren's service in Cape Breton after 1745; plans for an invasion of Canada were eventually abandoned, derailed by events in Europe in 1745 and 1746, and then in 1747 by news of D'Enville's expedition to Canada, although that expedition proved in the end to be a disastrous failure for the French. And yet, despite his personal successes, Warren remained frustrated in his political ambitions. Though he aspired to secure the governorship of an American colony, preferably New York, his connections by marriage with the DeLancey family proved a handicap. His career in Parliament after 1747 also proved a disappointment, for his bad judgement in opposing the ministry's naval bill in 1749 cost

him the support of patrons such as Lords Anson, Bedford and Sandwich. In short, Warren's career confirms how important it was to be the right man in the right place, just as it also revealed how fickle Fortune could be in denying an ambitious officer's efforts to convert success in the navy into a life in politics.

Nevertheless, when all is said and done, Gwyn leaves too many questions unanswered to make *An Admiral for America* completely satisfying as a naval biography. We learn that piracy was a problem in the 1720s but we are not told why this was the case [6-11] - neither Marcus Rediker nor Robert Ritchie are mentioned in the bibliography. Gwyn attaches much significance to Warren's marriage into the DeLancey family, yet little is said about how the marriage came about (Warren arrived in New York for the first time in July 1730, and the marriage took place in 1731). How did his experience with combined operations at St. Augustine and Cartagena inform his leadership and performance at Louisbourg in 1745? It never seems to occur to Gwyn to make a connection. Some events in Warren's life are described in great detail but without any suggestion as to what they might reveal about the eighteenth-century navy or the navy's relations with the colonies. Thus, we learn that Warren's re-fitting of *Launceston* in 1744 took several weeks, requiring numerous caulkers and the replacement of most of the ship's powder, yet we do not learn how a naval officer stationed in the colonies might organize such a re-fitting - did Warren's marital ties with the DeLanceys play a role? How were the costs of the powder (triple the cost [52] covered? When we learn that the court martial of Capt. Thomas Fox in 1747, over which he presided, was regarded by Warren as "so important" [141], we are not told why. True, the court martial led to the proposal of a number of reforms, but "none" were "earthshaking", as even Gwyn concedes. Then there are Warren's many acquisitions of land. How typical an indulgence were they of prosperous eighteenth-century sea officers? What does this reveal about the culture of the Royal Navy in the eighteenth century? How about Warren's philanthropic efforts late in life? Were they significant in terms of what they revealed about his character or can another meaning be attached to this? Time and again, opportunities are missed to use Warren's life to delve into the mind and culture of serving naval officers in the eighteenth century. Yet that, surely, is what makes naval biography a useful exercise.

Gwyn concludes that "There is no doubt that Warren helped make North America, for the first time, a place of permanent importance in British policy." [173] Yet there *is* doubt. Historians have known for decades that British policy towards America had already begun to undergo a critical shift in direction by the time Warren was in a position to influence official British attitudes towards the colonies; see, for instance, Jack Greene, "An Uneasy Connection; an Analysis of the Preconditions of the American Revolution," in James H. Hutson and Stephen G. Kurtz, eds., *Essays on the American Revolution* (University of North Carolina Press, 1973). Gwyn's efforts to give Warren's career a larger significance in the history of the British North Atlantic ultimately falls short of its goal, in considerable measure because it relies so much on the narrow evidentiary base of Warren's own documentary legacy, while too much of the substantial recent secondary literature which might have provided a stronger context for this treatment of Warren's life is absent.

Olaf U. Janzen  
Corner Brook, Newfoundland & Labrador

John B. Hattendorf and Richard W. Unger, eds.  
*War at Sea in the Middle Ages and Renaissance*.  
Rochester, NY: Boydell & Brewer, Inc.,  
[www.boydell.co.uk](http://www.boydell.co.uk), 2004. xiv + 276 pp., maps,  
illustrations, notes, index. US \$85., cloth; ISBN  
0-85115-903-6.

The period before the sixteenth century has been under-represented in maritime historiography. This is not surprising given the over-arching opinion that standing navies were really creations of the modern age. There hasn't been much question that nation-states and navies go hand-in-hand; few of the ramshackle medieval and Renaissance governments were in a position to support such expensive endeavours. Furthermore, many have assumed that, at best, medieval and early modern rulers had only the most rudimentary concept of dominating the waves. This provocative new volume is designed as a "corrective to the older English language interpretation of sea power in the Middle Ages and the Renaissance" [xi].

Such was the pervasiveness of Alfred Thayer Mahan's theories on seapower that many scholars have focused on modern navies to the exclusion of their antecedents. A number of historians in this volume take issue with or modify many of Mahan's ideas. Although Unger

and Hattendorf have edited a varied selection of essays which cover much of Europe before 1650, they acknowledge that this one volume cannot hope to right years of neglect.

The book is divided into three sections which explore Northern Europe, Southern Europe and Sixteenth- and Early Seventeenth-Century Europe. The contributors have employed different approaches to produce some fascinating chapters on topics as diverse as the Vikings, medieval Byzantine seapower, the Iberian powers, navies of the Italian city-states and Dutch maritime power before the revolt against Spain. English seapower is discussed in three essays but France is dealt with only in Runyan's chapter on naval power in the Hundred Year's War. Although this work can't hope to cover everything, the discussion of the French contribution seems slender. Still, the chronology and geography are widespread; the specific and cumulative findings are substantial.

What emerges from these essays is the creative ways that European states fashioned and employed sea power long before the modern era. There were a significant number of ship designs which emerged and were molded by the waters they plied and the uses to which they were put. Medieval and early modern gunnery is also discussed as the advent of "man killing guns" set the stage for European expansion and for new naval tactics[244]. By themselves, these developments make this period worthy of examination.

Another theme is the importance of merchant shipping. A sizable merchant marine is critical for a few reasons: the necessity of trade to generate taxes to pay for a more permanent navy and the employment of merchant crews and ships as auxiliary to the monarch's (usually meager) navy. Yet, for those determined rulers who wanted more than a "bare bones" operation, they could show very innovative ways of financing and using their navies. The three chapters on the navies of the Italian city-states provide illuminating examples. Some, like Quattrocento Venice, could be a "real laboratory of modernity" [158].

A number of historians argue for a something approaching, or even attaining, standing navies. (Jan Glete's chapter on sixteenth-century Scandanavian sea power is a case in point). Yet, the limitations are also evident. Even though this critical period sees a gradual movement away from the use of navies as simply transport and support for land forces, we also see the finite political and economic impact of many medieval and early modern naval victories. This, combined with the costs,

was no doubt a factor which discouraged the formation of permanent navies, as was the challenges of employing and financing them in peacetime navy.

Overall, there is much here to challenge our pre-conceptions of sea power in the period. This is apparent whether we are reading Francisco Contendo Domingues's chapter that argues for the Portuguese being the first and only world naval power or N.A.M. Rodger's "The New Atlantic", which is a genuine re-thinking of Renaissance and medieval sea power.

Rodger maintains that "Naval warfare existed long before navies" and that conflict was the norm: "There were no non-combatants at sea" [238]. He re-asserts what is shown in the various chapters: that "command of the sea" as Mahan saw it, can be traced back to the Ancient world and that a "quasi-Mahanian seas as a struggle for command of the seas" was conducted in the Middle Ages and Renaissance. [237] Arguably, his biggest contribution is to demonstrate the difficulty in "back projection" of terms and concepts connected with modern navies. For instance, Rodger maintains that there could be no privateering in the Elizabethan age or earlier: it was instead a legal regime of reprisals which should not be confused with privateering as we understand it. [240] Many of our terms and concepts do not mesh with the realities of earlier periods: "We shall never understand this period until we cease to stage it in modern dress." [247]

If it wasn't apparent to the reader before this, Unger's conclusion helps us see the "varied & complex evolution" of sea power - the interplay of religion, trade, geography, centralizing nation-states, and enterprising city-states in the south and the north of Europe. The publication of this fine volume will hopefully bury the misconception that this Middle Ages and Renaissance were a relatively static period in sea power. It is also a noble start towards formulating "a theory of medieval naval power which would explain why what happened did in fact happen." [249].

Cheryl Fury  
Saint John, New Brunswick

Richard Hough. *Captain Bligh and Mister Christian: The Men and the Mutiny*. Annapolis, MD: US Naval Institute Press, [www.Navalinstitute.org](http://www.Navalinstitute.org), 2000. 320 pp., illustrations, map, chronology, notes, index. CDN \$29.50, paper; ISBN 1-55750-230-7.

(Originally published by Hutchinson & Co. Ltd., 1972.) Distributed in Canada by Vanwell Publishing Ltd.

On April 28, 1789, in the early morning, His Majesty's Armed Transport *Bounty*, Lieutenant William Bligh RN commanding, was taken by mutineers under the command of the ship's acting first officer, Fletcher Christian, as it passed near the Pacific island of Tofua after a lengthy stay at Tahiti. This act, in a relatively minor vessel of Britain's Georgian Navy, and caused largely by rough seamen wanting to escape from naval discipline and the harsh life at sea back to an existence of indolence and gratification in Tahiti, has become arguably the most infamous and studied mutiny in naval history. It has spawned a veritable publishing industry, inspired four Hollywood films, and has added to the mythic lore of Paradise in the distant South Seas. One of the best books on the subject was produced by Richard Hough, a prolific British writer of naval history who died in 1999. When his book on the mutiny appeared in 1972 it broke new ground for the clarity of its depiction of the event. It was also noteworthy for the effort Hough made to put a human face on the characters of the drama beyond the somewhat wooden caricatures of a heroic Christian and a tyrannical Bligh that had filled popular, if not scholarly, imagination to that point.

Hough's research for the book was as thorough as it was all-encompassing, and provides a wealth of detail drawn from the documents that lay readers should appreciate, and scholars admire. The book is divided into twelve chapters that begin with the early careers of both men and their social origins. Bligh's excellence as a naval officer is clearly established as is his intemperate and choleric nature which tended to make him his own worst enemy in relations with his subordinates. Hough examines in detail Bligh's participation in James Cook's last Pacific voyage, as Master of Cook's *Resolution*, and Bligh's ability as a navigator, seaman and cartographer shines out. The image Hough paints is understanding and respectful, if not attractive. In 1789, Bligh was an underemployed naval officer grateful for the chance to take a small transport to Tahiti for a cargo of breadfruit to feed West Indian slaves. He was given few resources to ensure he did it successfully: a small, overcrowded ship, no marines to ensure his authority, and only the force of his character to keep the expedition intact, and his leadership unchallenged.

Fletcher Christian comes in for no less perceptive a character analysis. He is painted in portrait tones as a talented and attractive man, 'handsome and cheerful' and 'a great man for the women', but subject to moods of black depression and despair. Hough's chronicle of the events leading up to the mutiny follows a careful listing of the crewmen on the voyage, and the circumstances they endured, the nature of the ship, the seamanship challenges of the voyage, and always, the limited resources Bligh had at his disposal. The fatal delay in Admiralty orders that condemned the ship to the brutal attempt to get round the Horn, the alterations Bligh made to the ship, and the myriad social and political pressures which lay behind the voyage, are all examined in thoughtful detail. This includes Bligh's endless concern to do well in the eyes of the patron who had seen that he got the job, Sir Joseph Banks of the Royal Society. Hough's mastery of the documentary details of the voyage, and the subsequent mutiny, shows as he traces the ship's passage to Tahiti, passing by the Cape of Good Hope after the disastrous attempt to round the Horn, and the final ecstatic arrival at the fabled island. Hough then provides an intense account of the stay at Tahiti while the precious breadfruit trees were assembled and loaded on board, the sexual dissipations and emotional attachments which the mostly young men of the ship experienced there, the painful departure for the West Indies, and the mutiny shortly thereafter.

The incredible story of Bligh's survival with 18 loyal men in the *Bounty's* launch on a 3,000-mile voyage to Timor is followed by the ultimately tragic fate of the mutineers. There is also an account of Bligh's later life, the discovery years later of the mutineers' hideaway on Pitcairn Island, and thoughts on the true nature of the mutiny. Copious notes and a heavy bibliography end the book. Throughout, Hough's command of English rises superbly to the telling of a familiar but still fascinating story.

There are two criticisms that can be laid at Hough's feet, however, and they are considerable. Hough uses the expedient of creating dialogue for the principal characters in a number of scenes, adapting written journal entries into spoken words, as well as evidently creating imaginary dialogue. While effective as a dramatic device, it raises in the reader's mind doubts as to how accurate these conjectural conversations are, and is a presumption few serious historians would dare to make. Hough was writing for a popular audience, admittedly; but creating dialogue, even if one feels that it

captures the spirit of what may have happened, strays too closely toward the shoals of fiction.

A more serious criticism lies at the end of the book with what Hough rather startlingly reveals as the deeper reason behind the mutiny. He states that Christian's desire to leave the ship arose because Bligh and Christian were in a homosexual relationship. He led the mutiny because he wished to flee *Bounty* to escape sexual pressure from Bligh. Later, Hough would raise the issue of homosexuality in the navy of George III again, suggesting in his highly detailed biography of Captain James Cook that homosexuality and consensual sodomy were so widespread in the Navy that no one took any serious notice of it, even Cook.

N. A. M. Rodger, in his perceptive study of the Georgian navy entitled *The Wooden World*, argues somewhat more convincingly that homosexual activity afloat was no more prevalent than ashore, and was freighted with considerably more inhibitions, particularly the absolute and permanent lack of privacy in a crammed sailing vessel—even more so in the plant-laden *Bounty*. Nor should one forget the tendency of an otherwise surprisingly lenient Royal Navy to unflinchingly reward sodomy—'that black crime'—with certain death. Bisexuality exists in human beings, and while it is possible objectively to conceive of Bligh, with his devoted attachment to his wife and daughters, and Christian, with his passionate attachment to the Tahitian girl who would follow him to Pitcairn Island, having an intimate relationship, Hough's scholarship fails to make a convincing argument for it. The case is simply not made, but rather speculated, and with an odd aura that Hough almost wished it had been so. It is the principal failing of an otherwise excellent work that did much to clarify what went on in a small, distant vessel on a vast, remote ocean many years ago.

Victor Suthren  
Ottawa, Ontario

Bernard Ireland. *The War in the Mediterranean 1940-1943*. Barnsley, South Yorkshire: Leo Cooper, 2004. 224 pp., maps, photographs, bibliography, index. Distributed by U.S. Naval Institute Press, [www.Navalinstitute.org](http://www.Navalinstitute.org), US \$ 34.95, cloth; ISBN 1-84415-047-X. (Originally published by Arms and Armour Press, 1993).

The Mediterranean witnessed one of the most prolonged, varied and grueling struggles of the Second World War. The compelling stories

associated with bitter convoy battles and dramatic dashes and clashes in the desert have resulted in many historians turning their attention to the 'middle sea'. Bernard Ireland seeks to encapsulate 1,000 days — as the dust jacket puts it — of events into just over 200 pages. The narrative proceeds briskly, especially since the author covers not only the naval but also the land campaign, as well as an overview of air aspects. Given the tremendous range and variety of activity in this campaign, the book provides little more than a summary of its subject.

The book is organized chronologically. The first chapter sets the context of the conflict in this theatre while the remainder covers the unfolding of the campaign. The naval aspects garner the most attention, although the author does a reasonable job of describing the land campaign, and endeavours with some success, to describe the interplay between naval activities and the land campaign. Air warfare is sketched in briefly, although it is generally portrayed only as an element of the land or naval battles.

The interplay between naval and land warfare proved extremely important in the Mediterranean, as both sides faced difficult challenges in supplying their forces in theatre. The Italian Navy needed to supply Axis forces in North Africa, while the British needed to supply Malta — a vital outpost astride the Axis supply line — and keep a flow of supplies to Egypt. Traveling around Africa gave the British a relatively secure route to Egypt, but the long distance involved meant that convoys were occasionally raced through the Mediterranean itself. The importance of either ensuring that supplies made it through, or preventing the enemy from doing the same, made these convoy actions pivotal to the entire campaign, and there was a close relationship between success in the war at sea and in that on land.

The author is most comfortable discussing the British Royal Navy, but makes an effort to give a balanced account of the Italian Navy. The Royal Navy usually prevailed in fleet engagements, but this was only part of the naval war. Attacking and defending convoys was the fundamental basis for success in the campaign, and as Ireland points out, the Italian Navy proved a determined foe. Italian anti-submarine measures inflicted more losses than the British realized at the time and British underestimation of their opponent contributed to this toll. The greatest Italian weakness was in coordinating naval and air activity, and the introduction of a significant Luftwaffe presence in the Mediterranean helped offset this. When the

British were forced to fight convoys through to Malta in 1942 — or see the island surrender — the resulting major engagements between the Royal Navy and the Italian Navy, supported by the Luftwaffe (and some U-boats), proved incredibly bloody. Enough supplies got through for Malta to just barely survive, but British losses were extremely high at times.

The entry of the American Army into Morocco and Algeria during Operation Torch, immediately following the British Army's last major victory in single battle at El Alamein, marked a determined Allied effort to end the Axis presence in North Africa. The converging Allied drives gradually shrunk Axis holdings into a small portion of Tunisia, where increasingly effective Allied air and sea power all but cut off Axis logistic support to their land forces. The book ends abruptly with the surrender of Axis forces in Tunisia on 13 May, 1943.

The author provides crisp descriptions of all the key events in this dynamic campaign. Not all engagements are covered, but the author clearly endeavours to highlight the most significant and/or the most colourful. The result is what might be termed canvas history, where a single storyline is sketched out in a single broad sweep, with little room or time for alternative views or possibilities. In places he also adds some analysis, although this is brief or cryptic when provided. There is no effort to address the major improvements in doctrine that occurred amongst the Allied air forces in this theatre, for example. The complete lack of footnotes and the brief list of secondary sources confirm that this book is not intended as a serious reference. Three maps provide very basic orientation, and there are 33 clear photographs.

Ireland's crisp description of a major Second World War controversy is illustrative of his aggressive approach, with brevity and decisiveness favoured above nuance. Roosevelt's decision to demand unconditional surrender is dismissed as a "major *faux pas*" [193], and Ireland's next sentence contains his analysis of this event, concluding that Roosevelt's decision "prolonged the final stages of the war." Perhaps unconditional surrender did prolong the war, but the issue is more complex than the author suggests in his two sentences, and not all historians would agree that it was a *faux pas*.

This book is, therefore, of no value to experts, and should be read by general readers with caution. It provides a quick overview of the actions, but only occasional, and then modest, glimpses of why events transpired. Of course,

only one perspective is provided. *Caveat emptor*.

Doug McLean  
Oak Harbor, Washington

Philip Kaplan. *Battleship*. Annapolis, MD: Naval Institute Press, [www.NavalInstitute.org](http://www.NavalInstitute.org), 2004. 240 pp., illustrations, glossary, index. US \$ 39.95, cloth; ISBN 1-59114-038-2.

Battleships and major fleet gun engagements are the subjects of an extraordinary body of literature. From the technical to the tactical, the fictional to the factual, the mystique of gun-armed capital ships has attracted an extraordinary variety of writers, all of whom bring their own perspective to a well-worn subject. In this case, it is difficult to know what Philip Kaplan's purpose was, since this book lacks an introduction. The dust jacket notes claim that Kaplan describes "the lives of the men who crewed these giant vessels in war in peace." This would have been a worthwhile approach but a decided lack of focus and organization leaves *Battleship* "rudderless" and confused.

Kaplan attempts to trace the lineage of the battleship from the Tudor *warship Mary Rose* to the Second World War-vintage *Iowa-class*, his epitome of the type whose images dominate too many pages of this work. Despite starting with a simple chronological approach, the text and its accompanying plethora of illustrations ramble, almost aimlessly, with many diversions into barely related side issues and backward steps in time. The first part of the book (101 pages) deals predominantly with a succession of battleship engagements, ending with the destruction of *Bismarck*. Kaplan has relied on a standard set of dated secondary sources for his background information and his uninspired narrative does not add insight to the general subject.

Even more regrettable is the author's propensity for perpetuating many of the myths that haunt the pages of third-rate literature of this type. Kaplan claims Nelson devised "new tactics" for his famous victory at Trafalgar [11], ignoring the analytical work of Wayne Hughes, *Fleet Tactics*, which masterfully treated the development of Nelson's understanding of firepower in naval warfare. Kaplan maintains the Japanese victory at Tsushima showed "fewer rounds, very well aimed and fired at decisive range from the heavy guns of battleships, would yield far more effective results than many rounds delivered relatively quickly from lighter

guns". [21] His conclusion contradicts the seminal and authoritative work of David Evans and Mark Peattie in *Kaigun* that showed the highly effective Japanese gunnery was based on high volumes of medium-calibre fire, using shells with extremely high bursting energy. Kaplan also continues to categorize incorrectly the German armoured ship (*panzerschiff*) as a battleship [48], based, no doubt, on the widely-used and highly misleading common name 'pocket-battleship' for these unique ships. Eric Grove's recent *The Price of Disobedience* has categorically refuted any battleship connection for *GrafSpee* and her cruiser-like sisters.

The second half of *Battleship* contains somewhat more of the social history of life aboard battleships. Unfortunately, Kaplan reverts frequently to his earlier form in providing unenlightened descriptions of the careers of the German battlecruisers *Scharnhorst* and *Gneisenau*, wrongly categorized as battleships, plus the German *Tirpitz*, and Japanese leviathan *Yamato*. The reader could gain the impression that France, Italy, and Soviet Russia did not possess battleships, as Kaplan ignores these interesting and innovative ships almost completely. Likewise, the American *North Carolina*- and *South Dakota*-classes are overlooked, leaving the development of Kaplan's beloved /owa-class disconnected from their pre-war ancestry. The pages wasted on the advent of carrier-based naval aviation would have been far better spent on a more balanced coverage of his subject, including a fuller treatment of the Battle of Suriago Strait, which is dismissed in a brief paragraph.

The only redeeming feature of *Battleship* is a number of truly interesting reproductions of wartime recruiting posters, advertisements, and post cards. These images help to counterbalance Kaplan's use of stock photographs that have appeared in so many earlier books of this type. A few images from American and British films have also been inserted and, although they are all identified clearly, they undermine the credibility of this book. In the end, *Battleship* is little more than a coffee table book, one that adds very little of worth to the literature. Kaplan could have focussed on the social history of American battleship sailors, where the little good material is centred, and produced a worthwhile book. Instead, this is a less-than-mediocre book than cannot be recommended.

Ken Hansen  
Toronto, Ontario

Angus Konstam. *Confederate Submarine and Torpedo Vessels 1861-65*. Oxford: Osprey Publishing, [www.ospreypublishing.com](http://www.ospreypublishing.com), 2004. 48 pp., illustrations, index. US \$ 14.95, paper; ISBN 1-84176-720-4. Distributed in North America by Motorbooks International.

Despite its relatively small size and limited resources, the Confederate States Navy made a significant contribution to the overall Confederate war effort. As Raimondo Luraghi persuasively argued in his excellent *History of the Confederate Navy* (1996), much of the success of the South's naval strategy can be attributed to the farsightedness of Stephen Mallory, the Confederate Secretary of the Navy, who recognized the importance of confronting the formidable Union navy with "technical surprise." Mallory's commitment to technological innovation encouraged the development of not only the South's ironclads and commerce raiders, but also revolutionary forms of submarine warfare: torpedoes, mines, torpedo boats, and submarines.

This latter aspect of the American Civil War was first explored in depth, so to speak, in Milton F. Perry's *Infernal Machines: The Story of Confederate Submarine and Mine Warfare* (1965), which remained the standard account in the field for more than thirty years. However, during the past decade or so numerous new studies have appeared. While many of these titles have focussed on the story of the Confederate submarine the *CSS H.L. Hunley* - which was discovered, largely intact, buried four miles off Sullivan's Island, South Carolina in 1995 - this recent literature on Civil War submarine warfare does include some general studies. Among the most notable of these are Louis S. Schafer's *Confederate Underwater Warfare: An Illustrated History* (1996), Mark K. Ragan's *Union and Confederate Submarine Warfare in the Civil War* (1999; revised and retitled edition, *Submarine Warfare in the Civil War*, 2002); and R. Thomas Campbell's *Hunters of the Night: Confederate Torpedo Boats in the War Between the States* (2000).

Given the increasing interest in this facet of the naval history of the Civil War (particularly since the raising of the *Hunley* in 2000), it is not surprising that the military specialty publisher Osprey Publishing has turned its attention to this subject, publishing *Confederate Submarine and Torpedo Vessels 1861-65*, as an addition to its New Vanguard series. Osprey, whose titles are particularly popular with wargamers and modellers, has, in fact, recently issued several New Vanguard titles

on Confederate naval operations, all by the author of this current volume, Angus Konstam, formerly a museum curator and now a prolific popular historian.

These rather slight Osprey books do not purport to be definitive studies. Instead, they are intended to offer a concise and reliable introduction to a particular military topic, combining a strong selection of historical images with new colour illustrations that are usually distinguished by their attention to technical detail. (The new plates in this volume are by the military illustrator Tony Bryan.)

Even within these modest parameters, however, *Confederate Submarine and Torpedo Vessels 1861-65* is rather disappointing. Konstam's potted history is more or less accurate but poorly organized and repetitive, and his bibliography is seriously flawed. The book's selection of historical images is adequate, but not very inspired and suffers from poor source citations and, in some instances, second-rate reproduction and layout. As for Bryan's original illustrations, these are mostly unexceptional. In short, this book has all the earmarks of a rush job.

A well-illustrated, popular introduction to this topic, preferably in the form a coffee-table book modelled on *The Confederate Navy: The Ships, Men and Organization, 1861-65* (1997) edited by William N. Still, Jr., would be a welcome addition to the growing body of Civil War naval literature. Until such a book appears, anyone looking for a solid account of Confederate submarine warfare would be well advised to acquire a copy of Ragan's *Submarine Warfare in the Civil War*, which is in the same price range as this Osprey volume but offers the reader so much more.

John Bell  
Ottawa, Ontario

Brian Lavery. *Nelson's Fleet at Trafalgar*. Annapolis, MD: Naval Institute Press, [www.Navallnstitute.org](http://www.Navallnstitute.org), and National Maritime Museum, Greenwich, 2004. 208 pp., illustrations, maps, plans, notes. US \$ 29.95, paper; ISBN 1-59114-610-0.

With 2005 being the 200th anniversary of the Battle of Trafalgar and Lord Nelson's death, there will no doubt be an absolute plethora of books on both subjects, including many reprints of earlier works. A recent British catalogue of used books contained no less than 33 titles or

12% of the total listings, involving Nelson, Trafalgar, Lady Hamilton, etc. Reissued titles range from Southey's well known early "Life" to more recent publications such as John Harbron's *Trafalgar and the Spanish Navy* (Vanwell Publishing, 1983). There are to be special museum displays, a re-enactment of Lt. John Lapenotière's ride from Falmouth to London with Collingwood's despatches, and a large (and expensive!) memorial dinner in Greenwich's Painted Hall. It will, in the naval world, be quite a year!

*Nelson's Fleet at Trafalgar*, by the Curator of Naval History at the National Maritime Museum at Greenwich should prove to be as good as any in its category. Brian Lavery has mined both a hundred previous volumes as well as manuscripts in the museum's own collection and others, naval and militia lists and other odd sources for well known quotations, previously unpublished letters and reports and assessments of events. From these, illustrated by a large selection of well reproduced paintings, ship drawings, charts and diagrams on almost every page, Lavery has produced a very useful and complete brief history of not only the ships and the battle itself (the latter, in fact, only taking up some 33 pages), but the reasons and motivation for it. There is a small selection of biographical histories of participants from Nelson and Collingwood to ordinary seamen and marines, masters and wives left at home, and extensive details of a selection of six of the 33 ships directly involved in the battle on October 21, 1805.

For those already thoroughly familiar with the Navy of the period, its administration, ships and personnel, this history provides a small but quite fascinating compendium of minor details. We learn that *Victory's* fore topsail was 3,618 square feet in size, or 54 ft. X 80 ft.; that the French had heavier lower deck guns than the British, which meant a considerably slower rate of fire due to the weight of the projectiles having to be man-handled; and that the planned French invasion fleet consisted of *bateau grande espace* (about the size of Second World War Fairmile motor launches), each carrying 38 sailors and 120 soldiers across the Channel. For those more interested in current, or even Second World War history, there are many disturbing similarities. Indeed, according to Santayana's prophesy, "Those who forget the past are condemned to repeat it". For example, Collingwood's *Royal Sovereign* was ordered in 1788 and launched in 1794; *Revenge* ordered in 1796 was not commissioned until 1805 - rather similar to Canada's patrol frigates. Other ships in the fleet

were up to 50-years old. Despite the general perception of slow promotion in the Royal Navy, several captains of ships-of-the-line were in their mid-thirties, and the captain of the frigate *Sirius* had been a lower deck entry as an AB and taken seven years to reach midshipman.

There is a brief introductory chapter on the opening and progress of the Napoleonic Wars in 1803, a good summary of Royal Navy ship-building, rebuilding, and acquisition policy which provides a rationale for the make-up of Nelson's fleet, as well as a few very brief paragraphs dealing with their French and Spanish opponents. Paradoxically, both sides had several vessels in the line that were captured former "enemy" ships. There are also details of Nelson's pursuit of Villeneuve to the West Indies and back in the early summer of 1805. The story ends with a chapter on the storm that arose the evening of the battle which, to the distress of many officers and seamen, resulted in the loss of most of the captured prizes. Finally, a brief chapter describes the gradual return of the Trafalgar survivors to England, as late as December and January. Nelson's body did not reach the Thames until December 15.

Despite its perhaps simplistic coverage of history, of the problems and results of impressment, the skills (or lack thereof, by the Earl of Northesk for instance) of the various admirals commanding on both sides, and the reproduced maps that require a magnifying glass, this is an excellent overview at a very modest price of both the development of the Royal Navy and the battle itself. The minutiae included make for fascinating occasional reading in themselves. If one enjoyed Professor Michael Lewis's *A Social History of the Navy* (George Allen & Unwin, London 1960), also reissued in 2004, this is assuredly another book of the genre.

Fraser McKee  
Toronto, Ontario

Leo Marriott. *Fighting Ships of World War II: Vital Guide*. Wiltshire; Airlife, The Crowood Press, [www.airlifebooks.com](http://www.airlifebooks.com), 2004. 112 pp., photographs, specifications, index, glossary. US \$12.95, paper; ISBN 1-84037-416-0. Distributed in North America by Stackpole Books.

There are many reference books on warships of the Second World War. Some focus on ship features, some detail the various camouflage patterns while others go into great length about their role, capabilities and construction. Leo Marriott's *Fighting Ships of World War II: Vital*

*Guide*, is a combination of these goals. It is not based solely on capital ships as it includes destroyers and submarines; nor does it describe every ship involved in the war. The author's intent is to: "describe the major warships of the great naval powers engaged in the bitter struggles of World War II."

The book provides concise information on the various classes of warship, while at the same time imparting significant information in the form of a limited textual history. A problem arises, however, when lesser more anecdotal information is also included; for example, the sale of the USS *Phoenix* to the Argentine Navy where it was renamed the *General Belgrano* and sunk by a British submarine during the Falklands war [64] and the fact that an American Fletcher-class destroyer was named after five brothers who died aboard the USS *Juneau* in 1942 [90]. Although interesting, this type of information detracts from the main theme and seems superfluous in the limited space available on each page.

It is the inter-relationship of the different warships involved in the war that becomes clear as the reader progresses through the guide; specifically, the early preoccupation with battleships and their vulnerability to air attack launched from aircraft carriers and the subsequent increased focus on anti-aircraft armaments. The author includes such information as the significant battles in which a particular ship was involved as well as whether it was damaged, lost or survived the engagement. He also addresses any issues that influenced the design, number or construction of the class.

Along with a brief history, the guide offers a good balance between authentic wartime photographs and close-ups of models to illustrate detail. The page on the *Yamato*, in particular, has a section describing her place in the war along with a photo of her sister ship, *Musashi*, in 1944. It also contains a computer-generated aerial view used to demonstrate the size of her beam and a close-up of a model showing the unusual anti-aircraft armament. The use of models and generated images, is beneficial in this case, because it highlights significant features that may not be apparent from a distant black and white wartime photograph. For example, using a model to illustrate the uniquely Japanese red and white stripes on the round down of the aircraft carrier, *Kaga*, is a case in point. Yet the author uses computer-generated images of the *Myoko*- and *Mogami*- class vessels in spite of the fact that photographs are available. The image of the *Mogami*, in fact, is a recreation of an actual

photo taken in 1935. Used without a specific purpose, these particular images depreciate the overall layout of the book.

As with many publications, however, there are some omissions and a few errors that missed final edit. The first is the author's failure to introduce basic terminology such as the standardization of gun mountings. Although he refers to a ship's x and y positions, he does not tell the reader where these mountings are, something that should be done if the guide were meant for the novice reader. Another significant error is that the author incorrectly identifies the battleship on which the Japanese surrender was witnessed in 1945 as the USS *New Jersey* vice the *Missouri*.

In general, the guide can best be characterized as an introductory book for the novice enthusiast since it is neither a comprehensive reference book nor a complete historical account. By introducing the principle warships involved in the Second World War, the guide provides basic historical information along with pictures and specifications. In essence, it combines the quick reference aspect of a ship recognition book with the context of a history book presented in a concise manner; this is the guide's greatest feature.

Jason M. Delaney  
Ottawa, Ontario

Allan R. Millett and Jack Shulimson. *Commandants of the Marine Corps*. Annapolis, MD: Naval Institute Press, [www.Navallnstitute.org](http://www.Navallnstitute.org), 2004. xv + 580 pp., photographs, notes, bibliography, index. US \$ 55.00, cloth; ISBN 0-87021-012-2.

This collection of twenty-seven biographical essays on the U.S. Marines who led their service from its birth until 1983 probably doubles the published biographical material on Marine Corps officers, who have received little serious attention from historians. The editors assert that, through these biographies, one can follow the history of the institution, perhaps as some of us regard U.S. history through a series of presidential terms. This remains good enough for many observers, but others will entertain hopes as well for insider glimpses of how a service is run, especially one so shrouded in lore as the Corps. Many of the authors have used archival resources from their previous publications to array considerable depth and add more than a few new insights into the performance and characteristics of these leaders.

As in most such anthologies, the methods and writing vary greatly and several authors may have had particular attachments to their subjects. This facet became so problematical that editors chose to cut off the coverage with General Robert Barrow (1983). This left out six commandants [Kelley, Gray, Mundy, Krulak, Jones and Hagee], the first four of which completed their terms by 1999. According to Millett, the polemics aroused by the first two would have led to a hatchet job and a hagiography, respectively, and source material remained too thin for the remainder. Readers will, however, find little sympathy expressed for Gale, Pate, and Cushman, and unflinching praise for many of the Corps' icons. General Carl Mundy, alone of these uncovered six commandants, completed an oral history with the official history division, but less material sufficed to write the Robert Cushman essay. One suspects that the Krulak story might have involved similar polemics, but perhaps these factors lie at the heart of the current USMC, as opposed to the USMC of legend, closed out by General Barrow. This gap almost certainly motivates one jacket endorsement: "Careful readers will hope an addendum or sequel is in the works."

As partial compensation, Millett has written a pithy preface, offering inside glances at the evolution of the commandancy, some generalizations on types of commandants, and hints to the characters of the four missing figures. He follows this with a highly informative introduction outlining the evolution of the headquarters that supported the commandants.

The commandants may have encapsulated the spirit of the Corps in their terms of office in the classical period before the Second World War, but the standardization of four-year terms and the managerial, political and technological shocks of the post-war period places this notion in doubt. As in the case of a president or prime minister, does a commandant merit credit for all that ensued in his term? We can see weapons systems exceeding a score of years in gestation, and major policy matters also carry over a good deal of time. Millett suggests that we can regard pairs of commandants as effective organizers, but fails to show how this works. Indeed, if five commandants dealt with the procurement of the M1 Abrams battle tank [Wilson to Mundy], and at least six to date on the MV-22 Osprey tiltrotor aircraft not yet in service, then can we credit a single man with successfully introducing a weapons system or other major improvement?

Indeed, one can consider the modern Marine Corps a creation of the Second World War, although various credits are doled out in the lore for precognition. The commandants could hardly have driven the events. Thus, General Thomas Holcomb cannot really be given credit for masterminding the unimaginable wartime expansion of the Marine Corps, especially stark in aviation matters. Rather, he stayed on for quite a wild ride as American strategy dictated matters that stretched the very fabric of the Corps. The impact remained such that General Barrow was said to wish no officer nominated to three-star grade without Second World War experience.

In the years that followed, commandants became managers, consolidators or shakers moving in a world of inner Washington power struggles, defence bureaucracy, and unfettered domestic politics. These far overshadowed the mean party politics and inter-service rivalries that the commandants of the classical period had encountered. The case studies of the men left out would have developed this trend further. Barrow was first of the post-war commandants to never command an active USMC ground division, but not the last. Others proved themselves on Capitol Hill liaison missions, fixing scandals, creating firebrand polemics, developing insider relations on the Joint Staff, and so forth.

Who were the kingmakers? Several essays allude to the patronage, in and out of the Corps, required to win the highest post. How did the commandants exercise command? Although a few actually took troops to the field in the early classical period, we learn that the command of the Corps necessarily devolved upon subordinates, not all of them 'trusted' or even trustworthy. By the time that a commandant routinely exercised command for a mere four years, it became a commonplace to say that he had one year to launch his changes and three more to try to bring them to fruition. Some never got off the ground in that regard, because of petty scandals or embarrassments that robbed a commandant of the legitimacy among his fellows that such a small service exudes in its elite ranks.

That smallness of the U.S. Marine Corps, which one might think advantageous compared to the branch rivalries of the army and the navy or the uneasy relations between technocrats and rated officers in the air force, operates in its own inimical fashion. The Corps remained so small through most of its history, that everybody was well known, including all strengths and weaknesses. Even the modern

Corps, with rarely more than sixty generals on active service, remains essentially an exclusive executive club. This survey of the lives and careers of its select commandants reveals much, especially between the lines, of how the fabled service evolved.

Kenneth W. Estes  
Seattle, Washington

Pat Wastell Norris. *High Boats: A Century of Salmon Remembered*. Madeira Park, B.C.: Harbour Publishing, [www.harbourpublishing.com](http://www.harbourpublishing.com), 2003. 232 pp., photo-graphs, index. CDN \$32.95, cloth; ISBN 1-55017-289-1.

In the middle of the twentieth century, as salmon stocks in the United States seemed destined for perpetually low harvests, the British Columbia salmon fishery was noted for its strength. Fisheries managers in Alaska and Washington studied Canadian management practices which allowed fishermen living in British Columbia to wrest a tough and always precarious living from the sea. Residents celebrated those high boats that were able, through luck and hard work, to bring the biggest loads of the king of fish to the local canneries. Cannery towns thrived as fishers captured their prey by the millions on their seasonal migrations. Those towns were raw and haphazard, but vibrant. They were peopled with Indians and immigrants sturdy enough to withstand the rigours of life on the northwest coast of the continent. Pat Wastell Norris celebrates those towns, boats, and fishermen and laments the passing of what she sees as a golden age of commercial fishing in *High Boats*.

Norris presents a well-known story and tells it well. Her contribution addresses the changing human ecology of the B.C. coast. Some books deal with salmon and environmental change, while others address the politics of management. Norris writes about the impact the fish and fishery policies have had on the people of the region. Towns struggle to survive. People lose their livelihood and way of life. The rich human tapestry of the B.C. coast withers. Norris uses the journey of one classic seiner, the *May S.* as a poignant example of the human cost when a way of life is no longer viable. The old fishermen feel defeated, used. They cannot do what they know and do not know what they can do now. They feel adrift. While tracking the journey of the *May S.* and recounting the history of the region, the author attempts to explain how it all went wrong.

Norris does an admirable job evaluating the multiple factors that contributed to the salmon's decline. She discusses impacts as wide-ranging as the advent of the power block to the policy of spraying DDT near lakes and streams filled with juvenile salmon. The argument that industrial development in B.C. became more important than sustaining fisheries, while compelling, may not stand up to close scrutiny. For instance, Norris does not consider the post-Second World War high seas interception of salmon as a significant factor in declining runs, yet both the United States and Canada sought to restrict high seas access to North American fish. A sustained effort eventually yielded results. Norris also ignores the growing evidence of the impact of interdecadal climate oscillation on salmon production. Long-term weather patterns do not make good stories, however, and Norris is really most concerned about the fishing peoples who have lost a way of life.

If there is a villain in this story, it is the government. Norris argues that fisheries managers tended to punish the fishermen for declining runs while ignoring the most serious causes. Managers ignored the depredations of industry, claiming that the depletion of fish was simply due to overfishing. Framed this way, their answer was to limit participation in the fishery. Limited participation, declining numbers of fish, as well as technological advances like refrigeration all contributed to the shrinking number of shore-based processors. This resulted in even fewer fisheries-related jobs. As fewer people depended on fisheries, Norris argues that the government correspondingly reduced its importance and pursued its solution to the fishery problem to a logical end—limited entry, area and season closures, and buybacks. Norris also sees a link between British Columbia's emphasis on industrial development and the salmon fishery. In B.C. fish farms, the salmon industry thrives, but in a way that does not depend at all on the vagaries of returning migrations. What is lost in the process, of course, is a way of life.

*High Boats* is a rich and rewarding read. Norris' descriptive language evokes almost physical responses to places like Alert Bay. The book could have benefitted from a few detailed charts and maps, though. This reviewer kept a map handy to track the places written about throughout the book but not everyone has access to detailed charts. In the end, the journey of the *May S.* can also be seen as a metaphor for the resilient residents of the region. Rather than ending up in a graveyard, the *May S.* was sold to

a kayak outfitter. Time passes and all things change, but the people of British Columbia survive and thrive.

Montgomery Buell  
College Place, Washington

Gordon Williamson. *German Destroyers 1939-45*. New Vanguard 91. Oxford: Osprey Publishing, [www.ospreypublishing.com](http://www.ospreypublishing.com) 2003. 48 pp., illustrations, index. US \$ 14.95, paper; ISBN 1-84176-504-X.

Angus Konstam. *The Spanish Galleon, 1530-1690*. New Vanguard 96. ISBN 1-84176-637-2.

Angus Konstam. *The Pirate Ship, 1660-1730*. New Vanguard 70. ISBN 1-84176-497-3. A11 distributed in North America by Motorbooks International.

With more than 100 titles available in the series, the publisher uses a standard 7 'A x 9 'A inch format of 48 pages, with the contents changed to suit the specific subject. The paper used is of good quality, allowing good reproduction of artwork, illustrations, and photographs.

*German Destroyers 1939-45* is well organized, and contains an Introduction and sections on armament, radar, colour schemes and camouflage, ship's names and organization of the eight Destroyer flotillas. Details of the Classes include Type 34 *Leberecht Mass*, Type 34A *Paul Jacobi*, Type 36 *Diether von Roeder*, Type 36A Z32, Type 36A (MOB) Z31, and Type 36B (MOB) Z35. Information provided includes the specifications, modifications, power plant details, and the periods during which commanding officers served. Overviews of the wartime service of the German and foreign destroyers in the *Kriegsmarine* are provided, as are a brief bibliography, a colour plate commentary, and an index. Ian Palmer illustrates the covers and the book with superb digital, computer-generated, colour illustrations, including a cutaway of Z39.

Of the 40 photographs used in the book, many are from the *U-Boot Archive* in Cuxhaven-Altenbruch. These were apparently donated by former Destroyer crew members transferred to U-boats after the two battles of Narvik where the German destroyer fleet was decimated. Type 36A Class and all the modified follow-on ships were known as the Narvik Class; all were numbered rather than named, as had been the earlier practice with German destroyers.

Recommended for model builders and as a reference to German destroyers.

*The Spanish Galleon, 1530-1690* contains an introduction followed by sections on design, including development of the galleon, shipbuilding and armament. Under Operations, the author describes the Flota system, shipboard organization, life on board, and galleons as warships. He includes a useful bibliography, a colour plate commentary and an index. Cover illustrations and seven pages, including a reconstruction of a cutaway and a broadside of the *Nuestra Senora de Atocha* of 1622, are by Tony Bryan, a freelance illustrator. Also included are 38 reproductions of early iconographic work and photos of models and artifacts.

Considering the wealth of material available, the author presents a confusing look at the development of the Spanish galleon, starting with "In the Mediterranean, the carvel was a small, light, lateen-rigged trading vessel. Two such vessels accompanied the larger carrack *Santa Maria*, Columbus' flagship, on its transatlantic voyage of discovery in 1492...." In fact, *Santa Maria* is usually considered to have been a *nao*; she was accompanied by caravels, not carvels; in fact they were *caravela redonda*, meaning that they carried square and lateen sails.

According to the author, it is believed that the first galleons were developed from the carvel (caravel); that, as he indicates, has been disputed. The caravel was probably the vessel type that introduced frame first, carvel-planked construction to the northern European countries; hence vessels built in the north were sometimes known as carvels, but the name caravel remained in general use.

On page 5 is a section of a painting by Hendrik Cornelisz which Konstam believes is the *San Martin*, a Spanish galleon. In fact, *San Martin* was a Portuguese galleon, as was *San Mateo*, seen in Plate B, and also *San Felipe* depicted in Plate E. Surely if one is discussing the development of the Spanish galleon, one should use Spanish ships to do so. On page 7 is a photo of a detail of a tapestry depicting the Spanish capture of Tunis in 1535. The author indicates that a heavily armed *nao* is the centrepiece and the vessel is actually a precursor of the galleon as its forecastle is markedly lower than that of vessels that were built earlier in the century. The vessel shown has virtually nothing in common with the traditional iconographic understanding of a *nao*, which implied a vessel of one or two decks.

Undoubtedly, the Spanish galleon not only took features from the Mediterranean

galleys, *nao*'s and caravels, but its design was probably also influenced by the design of other nation's vessels. As it is well documented that Spain used ships of other nations to supplement her fleets, her builders would have been well aware of the differences.

While the remainder of the book presents a reasonable record, I would suggest *caveat emptor*.

*The Pirate Ship, 1660-1730* includes an introduction as well as chapters on the design of the ideal pirate ship, the origins of pirate ships, the conversion of a prize, small pirate vessels, pirate flagships, and the pirate ship in action. Like the other books in the series, there is a glossary, bibliography, colour plate commentary and an index. As with the previous book, this one is illustrated by Tony Bryan, including front and back covers and eight inside pages, which include a reconstruction of a cutaway of what *Queen Anne's Revenge* (1718) may have looked like.

Edward Teach, or Blackbeard, is believed to have run *Queen Anne's Revenge* aground off Topsail Inlet, now known as Beaufort Inlet, North Carolina in June 1718. Her remains are the subject of an archaeological study that started in 1997. While this study has revealed a considerable amount of information regarding the ship, her armament and fittings, it remains to be seen whether she is, in fact, *Queen Anne's Revenge*. The vessel is thought to have originally been the French fourteen-gun *Concorde*, operating as a slaver, before being captured by Teach off St. Vincent.

While pirates did not leave much documentary evidence, the author presents an interesting look at piracy with a decent bibliography for those wishing to take the matter further.

N. R. Cole  
Toronto, Ontario

John G. Reid, Maurice Basque, Elizabeth Mancke, Barry Moody, Geoffrey Plank and William Wicken. *The 'Conquest' of Acadia, 1710. Imperial, Colonial and Aboriginal Constructions*. Toronto, ON: University of Toronto Press, [www.utpress.utoronto.ca](http://www.utpress.utoronto.ca), 2004. xxiii + 297 pp., maps, notes, bibliography, index. CDN \$60.00, cloth; ISBN 0-8020-3755-0.

Collections of essays are inevitably hard to review. Assessments couched in academic clichés such as an "unevenness among the different contributions," or "truth is never

discovered by a committee," are sometimes wheeled out. In the case of *The 'Conquest' of Acadia*, however, the six authors have combined to produce a well-organized and insightful examination of an area, its people and contending old world and new world powers that places the immediate and long-term dimensions of Canadian historiography's neglected conquest in an illuminating and persuasive context. Repetitions are minimal and insights abound, so much so that it could now be argued that the better-known, later conquest of Quebec could profit from the same sort of balanced and wide-ranging rendering of the earlier conquest of Acadia offered by John Reid and his colleagues.

In nine tight chapters, and an introduction and conclusion, "The Event," "Precursors," "Agencies," and "Transitions" as well as the short- and long-term impact of the British takeover of "Mi'kma'ki-Wulstuwik/Acadia/Nova Scotia" are dissected and explained. A "constant three-way dialogue" between "imperial states" and "local societies both colonial and aboriginal" [xii] is at the heart of all the essays. Since the writers agree that "there is no single valid narrative" of the event and its impact and that the area under examination reveals realities of the "entire North Atlantic world," the role players must and do include Native Peoples, Acadians, New Englanders, the theoretical British masters, and the French at Île Royale but the geographical centre of the study is "the territory where Mi'kma'ki, Acadia, and Nova Scotia overlapped," modern-day peninsular Nova Scotia [xi].

Once the various narratives of the conquest are set out, the way is cleared to establish the "hybrid" nature of old Acadia and new Nova Scotia from the European points of view, as well as the imperial adjustments necessitated by this somewhat unique possession, a colony not really a colony and not really conquered. Following this, the complexities and non-monolithic nature of the Acadian response, and various strategies, can be unravelled along with a New England lack of co-operation, and outright obstructionism at times, which guaranteed, if anything, profound difficulties for effective British government in the region. For the Mi'kmaq, while the 1710 conquest was not "a significant event" initially [87], by the mid-1720s, they, like their Acadian neighbours, had to "negotiate the terms of an agreement with the British that would allow them to live side by side with each other by providing some guidelines for mediating their disputes" [100].

Meanwhile, from the imperial perspective, the diplomatic negotiations leading up to the Treaty of Utrecht persisted long after the date of the treaty because of its ambiguity on certain points which in turn led to a British "double diplomacy" towards both Native Peoples and Acadians. While the effort was made, the British reconstruction of a properly English Nova Scotia was no easy chore when all they truly commanded was Annapolis Royal and Canso; particularly in the face of an Acadian strategy and rhetoric of neutrality along with other Acadians "building ties with the French or British camps". [177] Through all this, what is described as the "weak articulation," or "administrative disjunction," between "metropolitan policy and North American conditions persisted"[202], which would later bring even broader and more serious problems to the eighteenth-century British empire throughout North America. Nova Scotia could have been "central to understanding the constitutional and political reconfiguration and redefinition" [181] that was necessary, but the opportunity was missed by contemporary statesmen.

The authors have achieved their goal of precisely delineating the "societal conflicts and crosscurrents that were characteristic of the troubled human experience of the northeast in this era," [204] so that their work on this sometimes marginalized geographic periphery meets Alan Taylor's call for "a North American history reimagined in its diverse fluidity" [209]. Admittedly, the broader picture of "aggressive Boston and a lethargic London" [128] could be fleshed out and further explained. Somewhat ironically, given the strong emphasis on continuing Mi'kmaq control of a large part of peninsular Nova Scotia, much more could also be said about the role of Native Peoples and shifting strategies. Above all, if family connections among Acadians are underlined with a new importance, perhaps family linkages among the newly-arrived British officers, garrison and merchants deserve attention. Although a portrait is offered of limited intermarriage with Acadians, and a virtual two-solitudes world in the Annapolis Royal area, it is interesting that as late as the 1755 deportation, at least one long-time resident British officer, John Handfield, had strong ties with the Acadian community. While executing his obviously obnoxious orders, he wrote a letter of introduction to friends in Boston for one of the close relatives of his partially-Acadian wife, a relative he was expelling from Nova Scotia. Nevertheless, this study has captured successfully the "delicate equilibrium," the

"framework within which Mi'kma'ki, Acadia and Nova Scotia" coexisted until the shattering militarization of the late 1740s and 1750s. It is an outstanding contribution to our understanding of pre- and post-conquest "Acadia," well integrated with colonial American scholarship and worthy of emulation by students of New France and île Royale.

W.G. Godfrey  
Sackville, New Brunswick

Ronald Rompkey. *Terre-Neuve. Anthologie des voyageurs français, 1814-1914*. Rennes, France: Presses Universitaires de Rennes, [www.uhb.fr](http://www.uhb.fr), 2004. 304pp., maps, photographs, bibliography. EUR 18,00, paper; ISBN 2-86847-966-9.

The peace of 1815 released the ships and personnel of the European navies to play a prominent role in the nineteenth-century consolidation of geographical knowledge of the world. Admiralties expected their officers to be acute observers, and hydrographic departments issued comprehensive and catholic instructions for data gathering. So it is that extracts from the writings of naval officers and surgeons of the French warships on the Newfoundland station watching over the seasonal fishery, form the backbone of this excellent anthology. It spans the period up to 1904, at which date the Republic relinquished its shore-based fishing rights as part of the renegotiation of global interests within the *Entente Cordiale*.

An excellent introduction by Professor Rompkey explains the origins of the fishing and processing arrangements based on "the French shore", identifies the major nineteenth-century economic and social developments which are illuminated by the collection, and gives an overview of the background of the observers. He ends by reviewing subsequent developments up to the end of the Second World War. Each extract has a well-crafted introduction and a judicious selection of footnotes and contemporary illustrations drawn from French and Canadian archives. The maps are adequate. The comprehensive bibliography will be valued by all with an interest in Newfoundland's history.

The anthology begins by picking up the great Linnaean tradition of the eighteenth-century voyages, with a natural philosopher, a ship's surgeon and a lieutenant setting off to record the flora and fauna of the area inshore from *la baie aux lièvres*. This lively account,

like others which follow, is liberally sprinkled with lists of species and is worthy of one of Jules Verne's globe-trotting professors! The reports of the naval officers also monitor the condition of the native populations and the activities of any British neighbours who had moved into the French shore during the war years. Generally an accommodation was reached with the interlopers, who were employed as "gardiens" of the shore facilities during the closed winter season.

The varied contribution of the French squadron is very clear. They explored the small ports and investigated unusual findings offshore; and they provided medical and spiritual support to the French shore as well as performing their pure Fishery Protection duties. They were very much part of the summer scene, with their own farm at Le Croc on the east coast, to which a stock of animals was brought each year in naval transports. The accounts of Vanéechout and Salles, and the diplomat de Gobineau, furnish particularly good insights into the social development of the communities in the fishing harbours and the growth of a largely Irish population which presented difficulties for both Great Britain and France.

The perspective of the naval men is balanced by extracts from other French visitors to give a very multi-faceted commentary on political developments as the Newfoundland parliament found its feet and its voice. The antipathy to closer association with the confederated provinces of Canada is analysed, and there is general agreement that economic developments (new fisheries, mineral exploitation, and railway construction) would drive change. Several observers remark on a turn from the sea to the land, and there is comment on the influence of a new generation of young exiles in the United States.

The development of St John's is covered well throughout, including some very humorous pieces. The broad conclusion of the French visitors is that the citizens were law-abiding and pragmatic. In and beyond the city, the landscape and climate is brought to life. The encounters with winter ice inspire awe, whilst in summer *les moustiques* leave their indelible impression on the explorers of the hinterland.

Professor Rompkey provides a very good overview of the tumultuous history of metropolitan France during the century, and the impact of regime change on policy in North America. Characteristically, it was the Second Empire which established consulates in North America and formalised the naval station of Newfoundland. It was, of course, the Third

Republic which relinquished the fishing rights which dated right back to Article XIII of the Treaty of Utrecht. While there are occasional laments for the passing of former glories, most of the views in this collection are remarkably balanced and pragmatic. Indeed, among the final batch of twentieth-century writers is a straight-talking seaman who suggests that the French fishery could be sustained without setting foot ashore if bigger vessels were employed.

In conclusion, this is a very accessible collection of published source material in French for the story of Newfoundland during an important period. All the authors write in an attractive style, and there is some fascinating detail about the lives of the inhabitants and their seasonal visitors. There is ample coverage of the maritime dimension, and the book is commended to readers of *The Northern Mariner*.

M. K. Barritt  
Bishop's Wood, Somerset

Peter Russell. *Prince Henry 'the Navigator': A Life*. New Haven and London: Yale Nota Bene, Yale University Press. 2000, 2001. xvi + 448 pp, glossary, genealogical table, maps, illustrations, bibliography, index, cloth; ISBN 0-300-08233-9. paper; 0-300-09130-3 (pbk) UK £11.99, US \$16.95.

The quotations marks around the description "the navigator" in the title of this biography of Prince Henry set the stage for this excellent life of Prince Henry (1394 - 1460), third surviving son of King John I of Portugal. It is the culmination of decades of work by Sir Peter Russell, formerly Oxford's King Alfonso XIII Professor of Spanish Studies and before that director of Portuguese studies at the university. The now distinct fields of academic study of the history of exploration and cartography (most commonly found within historical geography), economic expansion and colonialism (history) and the practice of navigation (when it is not entirely overlooked, within science and technology) were once inextricably linked. Prince Henry, rightly or otherwise, has been seen as a central figure in each of these areas. Yet his life has not been the subject of scholarly examination on this scale for over a century. R. H. Major and C. R. Beazley, both Hakluyt Society editors, published biographies in 1868 and 1895 respectively. Both works were republished in the late 1960s, and John Ure wrote a published a short biography in 1977. Henry's mother was Philippa of

Lancaster, the eldest child of John of Gaunt, Duke of Lancaster, and a granddaughter of Edward III and Queen Philippa. Russell points out that a determining factor of Henry's character was his English lineage and the chivalric renown of his Plantagenet family. His tomb, prepared under his direction and emblazoned with the arms of the Order of the Garter, (he was made a Knight of the Garter), offers conclusive evidence of the importance to him of the military, knightly and chivalrous ideal that as a royal prince he believed he had to uphold. Unfortunately for Henry, Portugal did not offer the military opportunities that had made the reputations of the famous Edwards of England, and the great days crusading also seemed to be over. However the Moors still occupied Granada in southern Spain and the northern African littoral.

Peace with Castille made war against Granada impossible, but Henry actively supported a Portuguese sponsored crusade against Islam in Ceuta (on the south side of the Gibraltar Strait). In this campaign (1415) Henry distinguished himself as brave if foolhardy. In the wake of the victory, King John knighted his three sons, and later Henry was made the Lieutenant of Ceuta but not, significantly, its governor. The resident subordinate did not leave enough work to occupy Henry's time fully. In 1420, at his request, his father made him the Governor of the Order of Christ. With his whetted appetite for military crusading and the financial resources of the Order at his disposal, Henry turned his attention to other areas.

Henry directed the Portuguese exploration and expansion into the Atlantic and south along the African coast for the next forty years. Initially he sent ships as military crusaders for Christ, to subjugate lands and establish a monopoly on trade. Indeed, in due course he was given the authority to license all trade and to collect for his own use all taxes. Under his direction, in the 1450s his ships reached as far south as the River Gambia. The Venetian, Cadamosto, joined his service and had command of one of these vessels. His journal, published by the Hakluyt Society, is an important account of these voyages.

The primary purpose was not the advancement of geography or the improvement of navigation, not withstanding the fact they may have been important byproducts. It was the contradictory motive of Christian crusading and trade. Henry did not easily recognize that people confronted by strangers anxious to fight, would be reluctant to open a trade. However, when trade was established, the most valuable

commodity was slaves. Henry never recognized the mutually exclusive nature of trading in slaves and Christianity. Indeed, contrary to the normal practice, in his will he did not even grant freedom to his personal slaves.

Even if Henry did not have a school for navigators, or go to sea himself as a sailor, or advance the study of astronomy (as distinct from astrology), this important biography must be of interest to students of early exploration, navigation and expansion. It discards the myths and places the later developments in those areas on a firm foundation. Regardless of Henry's own personal involvement he sponsored those who made important achievements and discoveries. Russell's work will be an enduring portrait of their period.

William Glover  
Kingston, Ontario

Uwe Schnell, Ursula Feldkamp and Erik Hoops (eds.) *Das Deutsche Schiffahrtsarchiv 24, 200J. Scientific Yearbook of the German Maritime Museum*, Hamburg: Convent Verlag, [www.dsm.de](http://www.dsm.de), 2002. 509 pp., illustrations, photographs, notes, English and French summaries, bibliography. EUR 19,50, cloth; ISSN 0343-3625, ISBN 3-934613-43-8.

Uwe Schnell, Ursula Feldkamp and Erik Hoops (eds.) *Das Deutsche Schiffahrtsarchiv 25, 2002. Scientific Yearbook of the German Maritime Museum*, (Festschrift für Prof. Dr. Detlev Ellmers zum 65. Geburtstag), Hamburg: Convent Verlag, [www.dsm.de](http://www.dsm.de), 2003. 512 pp., illustrations, photographs, notes, English and French summaries, bibliography. EUR 23,50, cloth; ISSN 0343-3625, ISBN 3-934613-53-5.

With the volumes *Deutsches Schiffahrtsarchiv 24* (2001) and *Deutsches Schiffahrtsarchiv 25* (2002), the Deutsches Schiffahrtsmuseum in Bremerhaven, Germany commemorated two important events, the retirement of former director, Professor Detlev Ellmers, and the twenty-fifth anniversary of the museum. Since 1980, the museum has published an annual collection of fine articles of German and international importance on ships, maritime history, sea life, trade and related subjects. Time and time again, the contributors and staff have managed to publish an interesting and broad series of articles relating to many different aspects of the museum's collections.

Luckily for non-German readers, both volumes contain convenient summaries of all

articles in English and French, a practice that began in 1994 for English readers, while summaries became available in French from 1997 on. With illustrations (both in colour and black and white) and useful references, the museum yearbooks offer foreign readers and specialists access to a large and valuable source of information. Any readers interested in reviewing a complete list of what has been published in the museum's yearbooks over the past years can download an index of the first 25 years from the website [www.dsm.de](http://www.dsm.de). Despite the wide variety of subjects treated, the editors present the content and graphics in an easily-read format, making each yearbook a complete, self-contained volume yet still with the distinctive identity of the publishing museum.

Volume 24 contains twenty articles, all but one of them by German authors. Pieces include sea travelling: a ship crushed in the ice in 1799 (B. Christensen, B. Pflüger and H. Ruhmann), sailing in the 1930s (M. Mittelstedt) or transporting cooled oranges to the Persian Gulf in 1975 (B. Hattendorff). Another four articles are on the social history of shipping, discussing work time, time off and salary at sea in Northern Germany, Scandinavian laws in the 13<sup>th</sup> - 17<sup>th</sup> centuries (Chr. Deggim). The one English-language article looks at the case "Sparbier," a female merchant navy member who was expelled from the navy for being a woman but succeeded in having the order rescinded (F. Broeze).

Contributions from leading names in European maritime history as well as many museum staff from Bremerhaven have made volume 25 a real jubilee issue. Articles range from a study of "the background of Swedish marine archaeology and ship archaeology in the history of ideas" (CO. Cederlund) to "saints, veneration and mobility in the Early Middle Ages on land and water (D. Hagermann, published in German) or "the development of the floating dock" (E. Lehmann, published in German).

In all, some 34 articles testify to both the international fame of the Deutsches Schiffahrtsmuseum and also the key role played by Professor Detlev Ellmers in the development of the Deutsches Schiffahrtsmuseum as an internationally respected national museum. Dr. Ellmers active career spanned 37 years and included 455 minor and major publications. In 1971, after a few years in the Römisch Germanisches Zentralmuseum in Mainz, he moved to Bremerhaven, where they were planning to develop a national museum of maritime history based around the medieval

*Bremer Hanse-Kogge* which had been found just a few years earlier. Ellmers would remain in charge for exactly thirty-one years. As director, he witnessed the *Bremer Hanse-Kogge* being reconstructed and conserved. Finally, on May 17, 2000, this project was finalised when the archaeological top piece emerged from its basin of PEG preservative. Until the day of Ellmers' retirement shortly after his 65<sup>th</sup> birthday, eight million people visited the Deutsches Schiffahrtsmuseum. A testimonial to the overall quality of the museum is its early addition and continued presence on the sought-after "Blue List" of the German Scientific Council.

Both museum yearbooks bear witness to the dedication, skill, involvement and professionalism of the museum's former director, Dr. Ellmers, and the staff and their colleagues who will continue the tradition of maritime excellence which the Deutsches Schiffahrtsmuseum began over a quarter-century ago.

Roeland Paardekooper  
Eindhoven, the Netherlands

Robert E. Sheridan. *Iron from the Deep. The Discovery and Recovery of the USS Monitor*. Annapolis, MD: Naval Institute Press, [www.navalinstitute.org](http://www.navalinstitute.org), 2003. xi+269 pp., photographs, illustrations, maps, references, index. US\$ 32.95, cloth; ISBN 1-55750-413-X.

The iron warship *USS Monitor* is easily one of the most important ships in naval history and probably the most remembered by the US public. In *Iron from the Deep* Robert Sheridan provides an overview of the history leading up to the ship's loss, details of the successful search for the ship's remains, and a summary of the *Monitor* recovery operations through the summer of 2002. This is the first book to cover all three aspects in one book. Sheridan, while a geophysicist with the University of Delaware, was one of the directors of the search team that located the *Monitor* site. He provides much interesting first-hand information, but the book has several problems that could have been solved with stronger editing.

The first three chapters provide information about Ericsson (the ship's designer), the Civil War, the battle at Hampton Roads, and the loss of *Monitor* off Cape Hatteras. While they serve as a good introduction for a popular book, there is nothing much new here for historians. Most of the material comes directly from other published works. I was dismayed to

see the author use the name *Merrimac*, instead of *Virginia*, for the Confederate ironclad. In the early days of the American Civil War, the US Navy scuttled the steam frigate *USS Merrimac*. Confederate forces raised the hull, rebuilt it into an ironclad ram, and sailed it as *CSS Virginia*. Sheridan states that he realized its name during the famous battle was *Virginia*, and then proceeds to refer to it as *Merrimac*. Most disconcerting in this section is his unnecessary use of copious citations for commonly known material. Also, the use of parenthetical (in-text) references have no place in a book, especially one obviously published for the public. Typically, these are used in a journal article when authors indicate to professional readers that they are using the latest information available. The use of fewer, really scripted numbers referring to endnotes or footnotes would have been less interruptive to Sheridan's text.

The best part of the book is the middle section, wherein Sheridan explains how the remote sensing team found the *Monitor* site. This is primary information from one of the leaders of the team. Sheridan includes personal insights of various people and incidents in the search. I found his thoughts and the team's analyses of data as they proceeded quite interesting. Some of these will be lost on the lay reader, however, because of Sheridan's inadequate explanation of the technology used in the search process. Here, and throughout the book, more illustrations would have helped readers unfamiliar with the project and geophysical instrumentation. Readers may also find it annoying to see many long unnecessary quotations from letters and reports, as if the author needs to submit all of that material as evidence in a court of law. In some cases they are quotes from his own reports, giving the book a cut-and-paste feel. Here and elsewhere, the author needlessly cites his own reports for incidents to which he was an eyewitness.

Sheridan covers some of his frustrating years of bureaucratic discussions, and the beginning of artifact recoveries in Chapter 8 through the end of the book. Gradually, the people who searched for and found the wreck felt left behind as state and federal agencies and authorities discussed and decided on the best strategy for the site. The authorities seem to have asked for very little input from the non-archaeologist scientists who located the site. Because of this situation, Sheridan's narrative is mostly either about his personal frustrations or second-hand information about others' work. This portion of the book is interesting and

informative, especially as the National Oceanographic and Atmospheric Agency (NOAA), in charge of the site, is just now publishing articles about it. Sheridan's is the first book published on the subject. One must assume that the NOAA *Monitor* team is planning at least one book, but is waiting until it has more to report.

The story, from Sheridan's perspective, is a good one. People curious about the *Monitor* project, who have not been following it in the news and public articles, will find it interesting throughout. Those who have followed the project through the press will like Sheridan's insider view in the middle chapters. However, the book is not an easy read, as the author and the publisher seem to have written and edited the manuscript for geophysicists, and not well. This would have been a much better book if the editors had spent some effort to take out many of the needless citations, change those that remained to endnotes, purge the long quotations, and generally proofread the work to keep it from constantly shifting voice, tense, and direction.

Warren Reiss  
Bristol, Maine

Donald D. Shomette. *Maritime Alexandria: The Rise and Fall of an American Entrepot*. Bowie, MD: Heritage Books Inc., [www.heritagebooks.com](http://www.heritagebooks.com), 2003. x+314 pp., maps, photographs, tables, bibliographical notes, index. US \$31.50, paper; ISBN 0-7884-2384-9.

Officials of Alexandria, Virginia, asked the author, a marine archeologist, to assess the shipwrecks, harbour facilities and other relevant features within and adjacent to the waterfront or buried in land reclaimed from the Potomac River. To do this, he first had to reconstruct the city's maritime history and relate it to the commerce of the region, the nation and Europe. This book was the result of the author's researches in local, state and national records, contemporary newspapers, especially the *Alexandria Gazette*, and pertinent published and unpublished studies.

George Washington drew a plat for the town for his brother, Lawrence, who purchased several lots when they went on sale in 1749. The first seagoing ship was launched three years later. By the time of the American Revolution, Alexandria had a population of 1,711 citizens and was the third largest town in Virginia. The war left the town virtually untouched. A municipal form of government was established

in 1780. Five years later the state legislature extended the boundaries of the town and designated it as the sole port of entry on the Potomac River. The commerce of the town depended on its harbour and its proximity to the hinterland. Facilities for regular travel and communication by land and water were soon established. Commerce, shipbuilding and marine supply and repair flourished in the 1790s. The town became a part of the newly-created District of Columbia, where the city of Washington was being built. Washington became the permanent capital of the United States in 1800. Alexandrians hoped that this association would be a profitable one, and for a time it was.

After the War of 1812 the commerce of Alexandria rose briefly and then began a slow decline. This was due in part to its failure to develop an extensive manufacturing or industrial base, a distribution centre for exports, and the growing power of the ports of Baltimore and Norfolk. Shoaling, siltation, ice and flooding also made the Potomac increasingly difficult to navigate. After 1828, there was an increased involvement in the slave trade and slave breeding. Commercial fishing was also prosperous. Dissatisfaction over its incorporation into the District of Columbia led Alexandria leaders to petition Virginia to take them back. Bowing to pressure, in 1846 Congress agreed to the recession.

Early in the Civil War, the town was occupied by federal forces. This led to an increase in both crime and prosperity. Alexandria became a major supply depot for the federal army campaigning in Virginia. After the war there were hopes that the town would again become prosperous as a result of normal trade and shipbuilding activities, but railroads offered stiff competition and Virginia was slow to recover from the war and reconstruction. In the 1870's several Maine shipbuilders moved to Alexandria to be near a source of timber for their old yards and to build schooners in the new. One of these men took over Alexandria's major shipyards. By 1880 this yard had built two large three-masted schooners plus one tug and repaired a number of river vessels. In 1883 another yard launched a four-masted schooner, the largest ship built in the town up to that time. But the Maine shipbuilders soon found out that the proximity to timber was offset by the cost of transporting other supplies. They returned to Maine and wooden coasting ship construction came to an end.

Fishing continued to be important, but the overuse of this resource brought about a decline in the early years of the twentieth

century. Steel cargo steamers were built in Alexandria during the First World War as well as steel lifeboats. After the war the focus was on breaking up surplus ships. The years of the great depression witnessed a further decline in maritime activity. This was aggravated by constant shoaling which dredging alleviated temporarily. Steamboat service between Washington and Norfolk ceased in 1948, and with it came the end of the daily use of the city's docks. In 1949 only thirty ships came to the docks in a year. They carried paper for the Washington newspapers. So ended the maritime history of Alexandria.

This book provides a well-written overview of the maritime history of Alexandria. The narrative is supplemented by tables showing aspects of the town's shipbuilding and trade in the eighteenth century. The work covers many topics but most are treated briefly. A simplified map showing the streets closest to the river would help readers who are unfamiliar with the geography of the city to better appreciate some points in the narrative. But all in all, this is a useful survey of an American port.

Harold D. Langley  
Arlington, Virginia

Nicholas Thomas. *Cook. The Extraordinary Voyages of Captain James Cook*. Toronto, ON; Viking Canada, [www.penguinputnam.com](http://www.penguinputnam.com), 2003. xxxvii + 468 pp., maps, illustrations, bibliography, index. CDN \$ 40.00, cloth; ISBN 0-670-91120-8.

It would be unfortunate if the title of this book led some to the thought that this is just another recounting of the life of Captain James Cook, for this is far from the author's intent and very distant from his success. As a Professor of Anthropology with more than twenty years research into the culture and history of the Pacific and its people, Nicholas Thomas examines the interaction of Cook and his European crews with Oceanic peoples, their interaction with Europeans, and the consequences of such encounters. Thus, unlike many biographers, the author commences not with Cook's birth but introduces him at the age of thirty-nine, still unaware of his forthcoming appointment as Captain of the *Endeavour*, and of his future extraordinary voyages and discoveries. He briefly retraces Cook's naval career, paying particular attention to his time in Atlantic Canada, shows how his years as Kings Surveyor of Newfoundland were to further enhance his

mapping skills and his knowledge of the publication of his charts for the benefit of others.

Cook's voyages opened to the European world previously unknown civilisations and brought to the peoples of the Pacific initial experiences of European society which were to prove very mixed blessings. Cook's outstanding navigational and charting skills revealed many previously hidden parts of the globe with such accuracy that others were enabled to follow, though sadly not always to the benefit of the inhabitants. Europeans, and especially those who became followers of Cook, were aided not simply by accurate charts but by Cook's lengthy journals where his curiosity comes much to the fore as he strives to describe and understand the lifestyles of so many different people. It is Cook's curiosity which forms the major emphasis of this book rather than the geographical and navigational importance of his voyages. Cook's encounters with such very different cultures allow Nicholas Thomas to bring his expertise to bear to interpret Cook's feelings and understanding. Thomas also provides some insight into the possible interpretation of the thinking of the twenty to thirty sets of indigenous people, including Maori, Hawaiian, Tongan and Tahitian, with whom Cook had contact during his three major voyages. Unlike many other writers, the author's deeper research even identifies particular tribes or societies among these groups and their interaction with their neighbours. He reveals the different lifestyles within such groups, demonstrating, for example, how Maori society varied from north to south and could certainly not be judged as one society at a particular stage of development.

Thomas enters the debate of recent years, questioning earlier judgements of Cook as a major hero, and helps the reader to reconsider various well-documented events. He demonstrates that violent incidents are far from restricted to Cook's third voyage when many believe that his behaviour was that of a tired and weaker man, who had not physically and mentally recovered from the trials of the two previous voyages and in particular, his serious illness during the second voyage. We are reminded that even on the first voyage, when Cook was in his prime, there was some regrettable violence. In the author's view, when considering Cook's behaviour patterns, "the third voyage is marked by ups and downs, not by any sort of downward spiral" [376]. Thomas refuses to accept that even the immediate occurrences leading to the death of Cook are due to lapses in Cook's thinking and behaviour.

They are simply further examples of a general behaviour pattern previously revealed on more than the odd occasion. It is a valid point, though one likely to continue the debate rather than end it!

Cooks' life and voyages have been of constant interest and study and have led to the writing of a considerable number of books. Nicholas Thomas has not simply added to the list but brought a stimulating and fresh approach, written with authority and in a style that will appeal to many. As one reads, so is the author's knowledge and research revealed creating a volume that will be appreciated by both the academic and the general reader. The 460 pages, carefully indexed, include nine maps and fifty-four illustrations, most of which are reproductions of the work of the artists Parkinson, Hodges and Webber. All are in black and white, and the book would certainly have been further enhanced by the inclusion of some in colour. Lists of sources and further reading are included and several pages are devoted to copious notes for each chapter rather than the use of page footnotes. Nicholas Thomas is to be thanked and congratulated on the creation of a well-written and researched book in a style most enjoyable to read.

Alwyn Peel  
Thorhild, Yorkshire, UK

Chris West, *Down to the Sea in Ships: A Shipbuilder's Story*. Halifax, NS: West Publications, [awest@ns.sympatico.ca](mailto:awest@ns.sympatico.ca), 2004. 180 pp., photographs, appendices. CDN \$25 plus postage, paper; ISBN

Privately printed books can range on a spectrum from embarrassingly awful to full and equal partners of books from university presses and large publishing houses. Chris West's memoir of his career as a shipbuilder, written primarily for his family, belongs at the upper end of this spectrum.

West was born in 1923 and in 1941, breaking with the family tradition of a career in medicine, joined the Royal Navy. His sea time as a midshipman included service in HMS *Orion* during her second Mediterranean deployment. The "Snotties' Nurse" was LCDr Peter Manisty, who had a brief and passing connection with HMCS *Kings*. West's account provides an interesting parallel to that of Mack Lynch, *Orion's* RCN radar officer, whose memoir was published in 1993. On completion of his sublieutenant's courses, he went into the

submarine service, and served in the Pacific theatre. At the war's end West was invalided out of the RN on account of deafness. Turning down an opportunity to go into medicine, he went instead to Durham University's King's College (in Newcastle) to study naval architecture, hence the subtitle, "A Shipbuilder's Story."

West's career as a shipbuilder spanned seven decades and four continents. During his university summers, and on graduation, he worked for Vickers-Armstrong. Initially he had hoped to rejoin the RN in the Royal Corps of Naval Constructors. Their interview board was not prepared for the candid views of a former submariner with war service. Of the interview, West laconically says, "We did not part on the best of terms" [91]. West worked at Vickers when welding was beginning to replace rivetting. At their recommendation, in 1952 he went to Malaya to manage the Blue Funnel shipyard. His description of the lofting process will interest all who want to understand pre-computer methods.

In 1958, West moved from Malaya to Vickers in Montreal. The yard was then busy building ships for the RCN, and other government departments. It was well equipped, and kept so. West was involved in the process of upgrading the steel-working process and the move to computer lofting. Fired with enthusiasm and confidence, the newly-married West decided in 1965 that he could save the declining British shipbuilding industry, and returned to Scotland. That job lasted barely a year. He then returned to Canada — to Marystown in Newfoundland. His work there spanned the decline of the fishery and the advent of oil rig support vessels. A distaste for Newfoundland politics coupled with family pressures made a move to Halifax Industries Limited welcome. West stayed at that yard through various changes of ownership. When he retired, the Irving family owned the yard and he was working on the navy's Maritime Coastal Defence Vessels.

In retirement he continued in shipbuilding. The Canadian Executive Services Organization is a volunteer agency that provides expertise to developing countries. Working with them, West was involved in projects in a number of countries, including Columbia, Ecuador, Guyana, Roumania, Sri Lanka and Trinidad. He finally retired in 2001.

This account, rich in flavour of life around the world, offers a candid view of the shipbuilding industry as it adapted to a rapidly modernizing world. Written for his family, it has many anecdotes and observations on living conditions— in Malaya as but one example. The

book is well illustrated with plenty of photographs. My only regret is that there is not more on shipbuilding. Nonetheless, this should be of value to all who are interested in the history of that industry.

William Glover  
Kingston, Ontario

Ted Wickson. *Reflections of Toronto Harbour: 200 Years of Port Activity and Waterfront Development*. Toronto, ON: Toronto Port Authority, [www.torontoport.com](http://www.torontoport.com), 2002. 176 pp.; maps, illustrations, glossary, bibliography, index. CDN \$95.00, cloth; ISBN 0-9730002-0-1

Toronto's harbour and waterfront have long been steeped in politics and controversy. The failed Summer Olympic bid and the Toronto City Centre Airport fixed-link issue in the recent mayoral election were the latest episodes in relations between the federal government, the province of Ontario, and Canada's largest city. Added into this equation is the semi-autonomous position of the Toronto Port Authority and its predecessor, the Toronto Harbour Commission — principal landlord, steward, and developer in the harbour. At least two royal commissions, task forces, countless studies, and numerous environmental assessments have studied affairs in the port and its geographical environs. Despite constantly evolving future plans for waterfront redevelopment, a balance between business activity related to the port and the access needs of a growing urban population remains difficult to achieve.

Ted Wickson, an amateur local historian and former archivist with the Toronto Transit Commission, provides an overview of development and priorities in the port lands over the past two centuries, in this richly illustrated book commissioned by the Toronto Port Authority. The narrative, which is divided into eighteen short chapters, describes the growth of York (later incorporated as Toronto) from a wilderness community and trading point on Lake Ontario into an industrial and urban mega-city with port and recreational aspirations. Arrival of the railways and their dominant position on the waterfront changed shipping patterns and physically divided the city from main port activities.

Shortly after formation of the Toronto Harbour Commission, a 1912 master plan was conceived for future development on the waterfront. Over the next several decades, western and eastern channels were dredged, port

industrial lands were developed in the east through extensive marsh reclamation, in-filling pushed lands of the central harbour southward, and a new airport was created on the western side of the Toronto Islands.

During the two world wars, wartime emergency shipyards constructed freighters, minor warships, and oceangoing minesweepers (described briefly in a chapter written by Michael Meir) and factories constructed shell casings on port lands. The Toronto Harbour Commission anticipated opening of the Welland Canal and the St. Lawrence Seaway and prepared facilities and terminals necessary for greater volumes of bulk cargo and the container trade made possible by bigger and specialized ships. The 1960s and 1970s became the high point for shipping activity in the port. Although the ambitious outer Harbour project looked toward future expansion, economic conditions and competition from inter-modal operations elsewhere caused a steady decline in business.

The Toronto Port Authority, established from restructuring of the national ports system in 1999, derives revenue predominantly from airport operations, a smaller shipping and industrial footprint, as well as moorage and user fees from recreational boaters. The federal government has turned back redundant lands along the waterfront to the city for public, residential, and commercial development, fitting given the focus in the last chapters on the amusements at well-known locations inside and outside Toronto harbour.

*Reflections of Toronto Harbour* will disappoint readers expecting a book matching the same standard as Robert Albion's classic study of New York City's port. Wickson has decided to concentrate on local matters and real estate rather than integrating the port's history into broader economic development in the regional hinterland, national transportation policies, and international trade. The types of records available in the Toronto Port Authority Archives, primarily related to leases, landholdings, and administrative matters, furnish a narrow perspective without research farther afield in Ottawa and other repositories. The chapters, while perhaps interesting in content in their own right, cover much the same ground as popular Toronto historian Mike Filey and at times seem disconnected without a basic argument or overlying themes. At the same time, the book deliberately ignores awkward issues and shies away from adverse criticism, most particularly alleged "pork barrelling" within the Toronto Harbour Commission and the dirty environmental legacy from officially encouraged

industrial development in the port lands. Costs and responsibilities associated with brown field clean-up in the transition from industrial to recreational usage continues to engage politicians, lawyers, and the wider public. The people of Toronto are told almost weekly that the waterfront belongs to them and their children.

The book's design and layout are of a high quality, while the glossy format suits the many illustrations, photographs and maps. The Toronto Port Authority's decision to distribute the book itself rather than through a reputable publisher and the relatively high cover price will undoubtedly limit the prospective audience. The potential for rising above a mere vanity book to mass appeal and explaining the Toronto Port Authority's side in the ongoing debate over the waterfront is thus diminished. Stewardship of Toronto's Harbour over the decades deserves greater rigour and context than just telling a good story. The port has and continues to contribute to Toronto's reputation as a leading North American city with world-class aspirations.

Chris Madsen  
Toronto, Ontario